

## COLORADO

## Department of Regulatory Agencies

Colorado Office of Policy, Research & Regulatory Reform

# 2021 Sunset Review

Colorado Resiliency Office





T EXCERTIVE DIFFERENCE OF THE

October 15, 2021

Members of the Colorado General Assembly c/o the Office of Legislative Legal Services State Capitol Building Denver, Colorado 80203

Dear Members of the General Assembly:

The Colorado General Assembly established the sunset review process in 1976 as a way to analyze and evaluate regulatory programs and determine the least restrictive regulation consistent with the public interest. Pursuant to section 24-34-104(5)(a), Colorado Revised Statutes (C.R.S.), the Colorado Office of Policy, Research and Regulatory Reform (COPRRR) at the Department of Regulatory Agencies (DORA) undertakes a robust review process culminating in the release of multiple reports each year on October 15.

A national leader in regulatory reform, COPRRR takes the vision of their office, DORA and more broadly of our state government seriously. Specifically, COPRRR contributes to the strong economic landscape in Colorado by ensuring that we have thoughtful, efficient and inclusive regulations that reduce barriers to entry into various professions and that open doors of opportunity for all Coloradans.

As part of this year's review, COPRRR has completed an evaluation of the Colorado Resiliency Office. I am pleased to submit this written report, which will be the basis for COPRRR's oral testimony before the 2022 legislative committee of reference.

The report discusses the question of whether there is a need for the program created under Sections 121 and 122 of Article 32 of Title 24, C.R.S. The report also discusses the effectiveness of the Colorado Department of Local Affairs in carrying out the intent of the statutes and makes recommendations for statutory and administrative changes for the review and discussion of the General Assembly.

To learn more about the sunset review process, among COPRRR's other functions, visit coprrr.colorado.gov.

Sincerely.

Patty Salazar Executive Director



### Sunset Review: Colorado Resiliency Office

### **Background**

#### What is resiliency?

Colorado statute defines resiliency as "the ability of communities to rebound, positively adapt to, or thrive amidst changing conditions or challenges, including human-caused and natural disasters, and to maintain quality of life, healthy growth, durable systems, economic vitality, and conservation of resources for present and future generations."

## Why was the Colorado Resiliency Office created?

Created in the aftermath of the historic fires and floods of 2012 and 2013, what is now called the Colorado Resiliency Office (Office) coordinates long-term recovery efforts, connects communities with needed resources, and supports communities to reduce the impacts of future disasters.

#### What does the Office do?

The primary task of the Office is to create and maintain the state's Resiliency and Community Recovery Program. Toward this end, the Office not only developed the *Resiliency Framework*, but also provides technical assistance to local communities and state agencies in their efforts to incorporate resiliency into their operations.

#### How is it regulated?

The Office hosts peer exchanges and the Colorado Resiliency Working Group, sponsors webinars and other trainings, facilitates grants and provides technical assistance.

#### What does it cost?

In fiscal year 19-20, the Office expended \$238,244 and allotted 2.33 full-time equivalent employees to implement the Office's various mandates.

### **Key Recommendations**

• Continue the Office for 15 years, until 2037.

## **Table of Contents**

Background	1
Sunset Criteria Sunset Process Methodology Profile of Resiliency	3 3
Legal Framework	7
History of RegulationLegal Summary	
Program Description and Administration	9
Activities and Accomplishments Trainings and Technical Assistance. Peer Exchanges Grants Interagency Collaboration and Coordination Newsletters. Websites Frameworks and Playbooks Colorado Resiliency Working Group. COVID-19 Response	.13 .16 .16 .18 .19 .19
Analysis and Recommendations	. 22 l
Appendix A Rural Economic Development Initiative (REDI) Grants	

## **Background**

#### **Sunset Criteria**

Enacted in 1976, Colorado's sunset law was the first of its kind in the United States. A sunset provision repeals all or part of a law after a specific date, unless the legislature affirmatively acts to extend it. During the sunset review process, the Colorado Office of Policy, Research and Regulatory Reform (COPRRR) within the Department of Regulatory Agencies (DORA) conducts a thorough evaluation of such programs based upon specific statutory criteria<sup>1</sup> and solicits diverse input from a broad spectrum of stakeholders including consumers, government agencies, public advocacy groups, and professional associations.

Sunset reviews are guided by statutory criteria and sunset reports are organized so that a reader may consider these criteria while reading. While not all criteria are applicable to all sunset reviews, the various sections of a sunset report generally call attention to the relevant criteria. For example,

- In order to address the first criterion and determine whether a particular regulatory program is necessary to protect the public, it is necessary to understand the details of the profession or industry at issue. The Profile section of a sunset report typically describes the profession or industry at issue and addresses the current environment, which may include economic data, to aid in this analysis.
- To ascertain a second aspect of the first sunset criterion--whether conditions that led to initial regulation have changed--the History of Regulation section of a sunset report explores any relevant changes that have occurred over time in the regulatory environment. The remainder of the Legal Framework section addresses the third sunset criterion by summarizing the organic statute and rules of the program, as well as relevant federal, state and local laws to aid in the exploration of whether the program's operations are impeded or enhanced by existing statutes or rules.
- The Program Description section of a sunset report addresses several of the sunset criteria, including those inquiring whether the agency operates in the public interest and whether its operations are impeded or enhanced by existing statutes, rules, procedures and practices; whether the agency performs efficiently and effectively and whether the board, if applicable, represents the public interest.
- The Analysis and Recommendations section of a sunset report, while generally
  applying multiple criteria, is specifically designed in response to the tenth
  criterion, which asks whether administrative or statutory changes are necessary
  to improve agency operations to enhance the public interest.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Criteria may be found at § 24-34-104, C.R.S.

These are but a few examples of how the various sections of a sunset report provide the information and, where appropriate, analysis required by the sunset criteria. Just as not all criteria are applicable to every sunset review, not all criteria are specifically highlighted as they are applied throughout a sunset review. While not necessarily exhaustive, the table below indicates where these criteria are applied in this sunset report.

Sunset Criteria	Where Applied
(I) Whether regulation by the agency is necessary to protect the public health, safety, and welfare; whether the conditions that led to the initial regulation have changed; and whether other conditions have arisen that would warrant more, less, or the same degree of regulation;	<ul><li>Profile.</li><li>History of Regulation.</li><li>Recommendation 1.</li></ul>
(II) If regulation is necessary, whether the existing statutes and regulations establish the least restrictive form of regulation consistent with the public interest, considering other available regulatory mechanisms, and whether agency rules enhance the public interest and are within the scope of legislative intent;	Legal Summary.
(III) Whether the agency operates in the public interest and whether its operation is impeded or enhanced by existing statutes, rules, procedures, and practices and any other circumstances, including budgetary, resource, and personnel matters;	<ul><li>Legal Summary.</li><li>Program Description</li><li>Administrative.</li><li>Recommendation 1.</li></ul>
(IV)Whether an analysis of agency operations indicates that the agency performs its statutory duties efficiently and effectively;	Program Description.
(V) Whether the composition of the agency's board or commission adequately represents the public interest and whether the agency encourages public participation in its decisions rather than participation only by the people it regulates;	Program Description.
(VI) The economic impact of regulation and, if national economic information is not available, whether the agency stimulates or restricts competition;	Profile.
(VII) Whether complaint, investigation, and disciplinary procedures adequately protect the public and whether final dispositions of complaints are in the public interest or self-serving to the profession;	Not Applicable.
(VIII) Whether the scope of practice of the regulated occupation contributes to the optimum use of personnel and whether entry requirements encourage affirmative action;	Not Applicable.
(IX) Whether the agency through its licensing or certification process imposes any sanctions or disqualifications on applicants based on past criminal history and, if so, whether the sanctions or disqualifications serve public safety or commercial or consumer protection interests. To assist in considering this factor, the analysis prepared pursuant to subsection (5)(a) of this section must include data on the number of licenses or certifications that the agency denied based on the applicant's criminal history, the number of conditional licenses or certifications issued based upon the applicant's criminal history, and the number of licenses or certifications revoked or suspended based on an individual's criminal conduct. For each set of data, the analysis must include the criminal offenses that led to the sanction or disqualification.	Not Applicable.

Sunset Criteria	Where Applied
(X) Whether administrative and statutory changes are necessary to improve agency operations to enhance the public interest.	<ul><li>Recommendation 1.</li><li>Administrative Recommendation 1.</li></ul>

#### **Sunset Process**

Regulatory programs scheduled for sunset review receive a comprehensive analysis. The review includes a thorough dialogue with agency officials, representatives of the regulated profession and other stakeholders. Anyone can submit input on any upcoming sunrise or sunset review on COPRRR's website at coprrr.colorado.gov.

The functions of the Colorado Resiliency Office (Office), located in the Department of Local Affairs, as enumerated in Sections 121 and 122 of Article 32 of Title 24, Colorado Revised Statutes (C.R.S.), shall terminate on September 1, 2022, unless continued by the General Assembly. During the year prior to this date, it is the duty of COPRRR to conduct an analysis and evaluation of the Office pursuant to section 24-34-104, C.R.S.

The purpose of this review is to determine whether the currently prescribed program should be continued and to evaluate the performance of Office. During this review, the Office must demonstrate that the program serves the public interest. COPRRR's findings and recommendations are submitted via this report to the Office of Legislative Legal Services.

#### Methodology

As part of this review, COPRRR staff attended meetings of the Colorado Resiliency Working Group; interviewed Office staff, officials with state and national professional and industrial associations, representatives of state agencies and local governments and other stakeholders; and reviewed Colorado statutes and rules and the laws of other states.

The major contacts made during this review include, but are not limited to:

- American Institute of Architects Colorado
- American Planning Association, Colorado Chapter
- Boulder County
- Colorado Association of Municipal Utilities
- Colorado Counties, Inc.
- Colorado Farm Bureau
- Colorado Department of Agriculture
- Colorado Department of Labor and Employment
- Colorado Department of Local Affairs
- Colorado Department of Natural Resources

- Colorado Department of Public Health and Environment
- Colorado Department of Public Safety
- Colorado Department of Regulatory Agencies
- Colorado Department of Transportation
- Colorado Energy Office
- Colorado Municipal League
- Colorado Recovery and Resiliency Collaborative
- Colorado Resiliency Working Group members
- Colorado Retail Council
- East Central Council of Governments
- Federal Emergency Management Agency
- Larimer County
- Special District Association of Colorado
- U.S. Economic Development Administration

#### **Profile of Resiliency**

In a sunset review, COPRRR is guided by the sunset criteria located in section 24-34-104(6)(b), C.R.S. The first criterion asks, in essence, whether the agency is necessary to protect the public health, safety and welfare; whether the conditions which led to the initial program have changed; and whether other conditions have arisen which would warrant more, less or the same degree of government action.

To understand the need for the Office, it is first necessary to understand what it does and why it was created.

Resilience, as a concept, has existed for decades, but it is only in the recent past that governments and communities have begun to operationalize it.

In 1996, the President's Commission on Critical Infrastructure Protection recognized that while the physical threat to national infrastructure, such as telecommunications, electrical power systems, gas and oil storage and transportation, banking and finance, transportation, water supply systems, emergency services and continuity of government remained, a new, more ominous cyber threat had emerged that demanded attention.<sup>2</sup>

The terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001, shifted the nation's focus to vulnerabilities from terrorist attacks and led to the creation of the U.S. Department of Homeland Security.<sup>3</sup>

When Hurricane's Katrina, Rita, Dennis, Emily and Wilma devastated the Gulf Coast in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ronald Fisher, Mike Norman and James Peerenboom, "Resilience History and Focus in the United States," Idaho National Laboratory, January 2018, p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Ronald Fisher, Mike Norman and James Peerenboom, "Resilience History and Focus in the United States," Idaho National Laboratory, January 2018, p. 3.

2005, the United States expanded its focus in resilience from human-made events, such as terrorism, to all-hazards events, including natural disasters as well as human-made events.<sup>4</sup>

In the White House's 2010 National Security Strategy, the United States, for the first time, recognized resilience in national doctrine stating that the United States must enhance its resilience, which it articulated as "our ability to adapt to changing conditions, prepare for, withstand, and rapidly recover from disruption."<sup>5</sup>

The years 2012 and 2013 brought home the need for resilience to Colorado. Wildfires in those two years impacted Larimer, El Paso and Fremont Counties, as well as the San Luis Valley. The fires destroyed 1,100 homes and led to \$1.2 billion in insurance claims.

2013 also brought historic floods to the state, impacting 24 counties, destroying 1,800 homes, causing \$3.9 billion in damage and claiming 10 lives.

In the immediate aftermath of these disasters, local communities were absorbed with their own recovery efforts, limiting the extent to which they could assist one another.

These communities recognized the need for greater communication from the State. In this environment, the Governor created the Colorado Resiliency and Recovery Office (CRRO) within the Governor's Office, with the goal of coordinating fire and flood recovery.

Just a few years later, in 2017, the CRRO was moved to the Department of Local Affairs and renamed the Colorado Resiliency Office (Office). In 2018, the Office was created in statute, giving it a greater sense of permanence.

But what is resilience? In addition to the White House definition above, others have attempted to define it.

The U.S. Department of Homeland Security defines resilience as "the ability to adapt to changing conditions and withstand and rapidly recover from disruption due to emergencies."

The National Research Council defines resilience as "the ability to prepare and plan for, absorb, recover from, or more successfully adapt to actual or potential adverse events."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Ronald Fisher, Mike Norman and James Peerenboom, "Resilience History and Focus in the United States," Idaho National Laboratory, January 2018, p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The White House, "National Security Strategy," May 2010, p. 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Ronald Fisher, Mike Norman and James Peerenboom, "Resilience History and Focus in the United States," Idaho National Laboratory, January 2018, p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. *Resilient America*. Retrieved November 9, 2020, from www.nationalacademies.org/resilient-america/about; National Research Council, *Disaster Resilience: A National Imperative*, 2012, The National Academies Press, p. 1

#### Colorado statute defines the term as

the ability of communities to rebound, positively adapt to, or thrive amidst changing conditions or challenges, including human-caused and natural disasters, and to maintain quality of life, healthy growth, durable systems, economic vitality, and conservation of resources for present and future generations.8

#### In short,

There is no single precise and universally accepted definition of resilience or means for how it should be measured, although there is some common ground. Some degree of general consensus is emerging that resilience is about attributes (e.g. economic, social, informational) or capacities across a number of dimensions (e.g. disaster cycle stages) leading to groups of components of resilience indicators (e.g. the use of the 'Cs' or capitals, as in the '5Cs' such as physical, natural, economic, social and infrastructural capacities and the '4Rs' which are attributes, qualities or properties of resilience: rapidity, robustness. redundancy resourcefulness).9

This holistic approach has only gained momentum as both natural and human-made disasters become more frequent and impactful. One need only consider the COVID-19 pandemic or the fact that 15 of Colorado's largest wildfires have occurred since 2012, with three of those occurring in just one year-2020.

Further, between 1980 and 2020, Colorado experienced no fewer than 52 events costing \$1 billion or more in 2021 dollars, with 30 of those (58 percent) occurring since 2010.

And Colorado is not alone. Since 1980, the United States has sustained 291 weather and climate disasters where overall costs reached \$1 billion or more in 2021 dollars. The total for all of these events exceeds \$1.9 trillion. 10

As of March 2019, at least 34 states and U.S. territories, including Colorado, had launched resiliency efforts. 11

<sup>8 § 24-33.5-703(7.5),</sup> C.R.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Dennis Parker (2020), "Disaster resilience - a challenged science," Environmental Hazards, 19:1, p. 4. <sup>10</sup> NOAA National Centers for Environmental Information. *Billion-Dollar Weather and Climate Disasters*: Overview. Retrieved June 22, 2021, from ncdc.noaa.gov/billions/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> International Economic Development Council, States of Resilience, A Comparison of Resilience Efforts in U.S. States and Territories, March 2019, p. 2.

## Legal Framework

#### **History of Regulation**

In a sunset review, the Colorado Office of Policy, Research and Regulatory Reform (COPRRR) is guided by the sunset criteria located in section 24-34-104(6)(b), Colorado Revised Statutes (C.R.S.). The first sunset criterion questions whether regulation by the agency is necessary to protect the public health, safety and welfare; whether the conditions which led to the initial regulation have changed; and whether other conditions have arisen that would warrant more, less or the same degree of regulation.

One way that COPRRR addresses this is by examining why the program was established and how it has evolved over time.

Following the historic fires and floods of 2012 and 2013, the Governor created the Colorado Resiliency and Recovery Office (CRRO) within the Governor's Office in an effort to "coordinate long-term recovery efforts, connect communities with state and federal resources, and support communities to reduce the impacts of future disasters." <sup>12</sup>

In an effort to ensure the CRRO's continuation past the upcoming change in administrations in 2018 and recognizing the Department of Local Affairs' (DOLA's) role in strengthening Colorado's communities, the CRRO was moved to DOLA in 2017 and renamed the Colorado Resiliency Office (Office).

House Bill 18-1394 ensconced the Office in statute as part of a larger effort to update the Colorado Disaster Emergency Act. However, continued funding of the Office remained an open question, as the funding under which it had been operating was due to expire at the end of June 2019. As a result, the Office was created subject to available funding.

In 2019, the Office received a General Fund appropriation to continue its work and it was scheduled for its first sunset review in 2021.

#### **Legal Summary**

The second and third sunset criteria question

Whether the existing statutes and regulations establish the least restrictive form of regulation consistent with the public interest, considering other available regulatory mechanisms, and

Whether agency rules enhance the public interest and are within the scope

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> House Bill 19-1292, § 1(a).

of legislative intent; and whether the agency operates in the public interest and whether its operation is impeded or enhanced by existing statutes, rules, procedures and practices and any other circumstances, including budgetary, resource and personnel matters.

A summary of the current statutes and rules is necessary to understand whether regulation is set at the appropriate level and whether the current laws are impeding or enhancing the agency's ability to operate in the public interest.

The Office is a Type 2 entity housed in DOLA's Division of Local Government (DLG) and the Director of the DLG is required to employ the Director of the Office.<sup>13</sup>

The primary task of the Office is to create and maintain the state's Resiliency and Community Recovery Program by: 14

- Developing a plan to improve coordination among state agencies and local jurisdictions to support community and economic recovery efforts;
- Providing technical assistance to local governments for the implementation of resilience planning, including resiliency frameworks, vulnerability profiles, riskreduction plans and economic development strategies;
- Providing technical assistance to state agencies for the implementation of resilience policies and procedures and to institutionalize resilience practices across departments;
- Providing technical assistance to local governments and state agencies to secure additional resources and investment to implement resilience solutions;
- Integrating resilience criteria into existing grant programs;
- Providing policy advocacy at the federal level;
- Developing metrics and targets to measure the short- and long-term success of resilience efforts; and
- Supporting long-term community recovery efforts and resource navigation after a disaster.

In developing this program, the Office must utilize a process that includes local governments, state agencies, business, labor, industry, agriculture, civic and volunteer organizations, academia, community leaders and other stakeholders, <sup>15</sup> as well as consult with, at a minimum, the Governor's Office, the Department of Public Safety and the Department of Public Health and Environment. <sup>16</sup>

Finally, DOLA and the Office may obtain gifts, grants or donations in order to fulfill the Office's statutory mandates.<sup>17</sup>

<sup>14</sup> § 24-32-122(1)(a), C.R.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> § 24-32-121(1), C.R.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> § 24-32-122(3), C.R.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> § 24-32-122(2), C.R.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> § 24-32-122(5), C.R.S.

## Program Description and Administration

In a sunset review, the Colorado Office of Policy, Research and Regulatory Reform (COPRRR) is guided by sunset criteria located in section 24-34-104(6)(b), Colorado Revised Statutes (C.R.S.). The third, fourth and fifth sunset criteria question:

Whether the agency operates in the public interest and whether its operation is impeded or enhanced by existing statutes, rules, procedures practices and any other circumstances, including budgetary, resource and personnel matters;

Whether an analysis of agency operations indicates that the agency performs its statutory duties efficiently and effectively; and

Whether the composition of the agency's board or commission adequately represents the public interest and whether the agency encourages public participation in its decisions rather than participation only by the people it regulates.

In part, COPRRR utilizes this section of the report to evaluate the agency according to these criteria.

The primary task of the Colorado Resiliency Office (Office), located in the Department of Local Affairs (DOLA) is to create and maintain the state's Resiliency and Community Recovery Program by:<sup>18</sup>

- Developing a plan to improve coordination among state agencies and local jurisdictions to support community and economic recovery efforts;
- Providing technical assistance to local governments for the implementation of resilience planning, including resiliency frameworks, vulnerability profiles, riskreduction plans and economic development strategies;
- Providing technical assistance to state agencies for the implementation of resilience policies and procedures and to institutionalize resilience practices across departments;
- Providing technical assistance to local governments and state agencies to secure additional resources and investment to implement resilience solutions;
- Integrating resilience criteria into existing grant programs;
- Providing policy advocacy at the federal level;
- Developing metrics and targets to measure the short- and long-term success of resilience efforts; and
- Supporting long-term community recovery efforts and resource navigation after a disaster.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> § 24-32-122(1)(a), C.R.S.

In developing this program, the Office must utilize a process that includes local governments, state agencies, business, labor, industry, agriculture, civic and volunteer organizations, academia, community leaders and other stakeholders, <sup>19</sup> as well as consult with, at a minimum, the Governor's Office, the Department of Public Safety and the Department of Public Health and Environment. <sup>20</sup>

Table 1 below, illustrates, for the fiscal years indicated, the Office's expenditures and allocation of personnel, expressed as full-time equivalent (FTE) employees.

Table 1
Agency Fiscal Information

Fiscal Year	Total Program Expenditures	Total FTE
15-16	\$558,632.87	6
16-17	\$515,728.72	5
17-18	\$353,876.73	4
18-19	\$318,178.65	3
19-20	\$238,244.00	2.33

The Office moved from the Governor's Office to DOLA in August 2017. Therefore, expenditures and FTE prior to this date reflect the Office as it existed when it was in the Governor's Office.

When the Office moved to DOLA, it was funded by an interagency agreement between the Division of Homeland Security and Emergency Management (DHSEM) and DOLA, which provided funding through the end of fiscal year 18-19. In fiscal year 19-20, the General Assembly funded the Office with General Fund dollars.

The fluctuations in FTE can generally be attributed to the fluctuations in funding source as well as vacancies.

Office staffing in fiscal year 20-21 consisted of 4.0 FTE:

- The Office Director (1.0 FTE Community and Economic Development VI) serves as the state's Chief Resilience Officer, oversees the Resiliency and Community Recovery Program for the state and coordinates interagency resiliency and long-term recovery actions across state agencies.
- The Resiliency Program Manager (1.0 FTE Community and Economic Development III) works across multiple state agencies to develop, implement and manage programs and activities that advance the state's resiliency. This position

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> § 24-32-122(3), C.R.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> § 24-32-122(2), C.R.S.

manages the Colorado Resiliency Working Group, provides support and technical assistance to state agencies to build resiliency into operations and investments, as well as local communities in their pursuit of resiliency. This position performs a wide range of strategic and coordinated activities with multiple local, state and federal partners.

- The Local Resiliency Manager (1.0 FTE Community and Economic Development III) builds and maintains the local and regional resiliency and recovery planning program to meet locally-identified needs and priorities. This position provides direct resiliency planning expertise to local governments and communities and seeks funding opportunities to advance local resilience and recovery priorities.
- The Rural Prosperity Manager (1.0 FTE Community and Economic Development IV) provides strategic planning, coordination, financial assistance programming and technical expertise to promote rural community economic development, stabilization, diversification and resilience. This position administers the Rural Economic Development Initiative (REDI) grant program, leads a coordinated state agency response across all departments under the Rural Economic Advancement of Colorado Towns initiative and provides recommendations to the Executive Director of DOLA in support of the state's Just Transition initiative. Although a member of the Office staff, this position is funded by DOLA's Division of Local Government (DLG), and not the Office. As a result, this FTE and the expenditures associated with it are not reflected in Table 1 above.

Additionally, the Office has secured grant funding from various sources to assist in funding its various functions. Table 2, below, illustrates the grants secured by the Office since calendar year 2014, along with the amount of each grant, the purpose for the award and the source of the grant.

Table 2
Grants Awarded to the Office

Calendar Year	Grant Source	Purpose of Grant	Grant Amount
2014	Rose Community Foundation	National Resilience Grant Application Process	\$70,000
2019	Community Development Block Grant - Disaster Recovery	Colorado Resiliency Institutionalization Project	\$178,000
2020	Community Development Block Grant - Disaster Recovery	Colorado Resiliency Framework	\$149,980
2020	Community Development Block Grant - Disaster Recovery	Office Resources and Website	\$195,568
2021	U.S. Economic Development Administration	COVID Regional Resiliency and Recovery Roadmaps	\$2,331,907

The Community Development Block Grant program is administered by the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development. As such, all but the 2014 grant from the Rose Community Foundation were federal grants. The projects funded by these various grants are discussed in greater detail in sections below.

Importantly, the U.S. Economic Development Administration grant, awarded in spring 2021, will serve to fund 4.5 FTE for the two-year grant cycle. These positions will include four recovery program managers and a part-time roadmap program assistant. The Office is managing this grant in partnership with the Office of Economic Development and International Trade and Community Builders, a non-profit organization.

In June 2021, the Office received a technical assistance award from the U.S. Climate Alliance to explore expanding resiliency funding opportunities in Colorado, including the development of a potential Community Resiliency Partnership Fund. Although no exact dollar figure was attached to this award, Office staff estimates the consulting services award to be valued at between \$70,000 and \$95,000.

In sum, the Office has managed to secure approximately \$3 million in grant funds since 2014.

#### **Activities and Accomplishments**

Statute assigns several distinct tasks to the Office:21

- Create, maintain and keep current the Resiliency and Community Recovery Program;
- Develop a plan to improve coordination among state agencies and local jurisdictions to support community and economic recovery efforts and to address risk and vulnerability reduction;
- Provide technical assistance to local governments for the implementation of resilience planning, including resilience frameworks, vulnerability profiles, riskreduction plans and economic development strategies;
- Provide technical assistance to state agencies for the implementation of resilience policies and procedures and to institutionalize resilience practices across departments and agencies;
- Provide technical assistance to local governments and state agencies to secure additional resources and investment to implement resilience solutions;
- Integrate resilience criteria into existing competitive grant programs;
- Provide policy advocacy to shape federal resilience efforts;
- Develop metrics and targets to measure the short- and long-term success of resilience efforts and actions; and
- Support long-term community recovery efforts and resource navigation after a disaster.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> § 24-32-122(1), C.R.S.

As the discussion below illustrates, the Office has engaged in numerous activities to accomplish these tasks. Naturally, many of these activities relate to more than one of the assigned tasks.

Overall, the Office's approach to resiliency planning emphasizes collaboration, community building, connections across sectors and consideration of future conditions and challenges. Integrating resiliency into policy development and implementation at the earliest opportunity increases the likelihood of positive impacts.

#### Trainings and Technical Assistance

Part of the Office's efforts to support local communities includes technical assistance, which can take many forms. Technical assistance may consist of phone calls, it may consist of something more formal and long lasting, such as trainings or actual "boots on the ground" assistance, or it may consist of any variation in between.

Since 2018, the Office has provided at least 20 communities with what might be considered more formal or in-depth technical assistance by way of resiliency planning and disaster recovery training sessions. Such technical assistance was provided to:

- Southern Ute Tribe resiliency;
- Arvada resiliency;
- Bayfield resiliency;
- Durango resiliency;
- Eagle resiliency;
- Estes Park resiliency and disaster recovery;
- Ignacio resiliency;
- Lake City disaster recovery;
- La Veta disaster recovery;
- Walsenberg disaster recovery;
- Boulder County resiliency;
- Clear Creek County resiliency and disaster recovery;
- Costilla County disaster recovery;
- El Paso County resiliency;
- Gunnison County resiliency and disaster recovery;
- Grand County disaster recovery;
- Huerfano County disaster recovery;
- Lake County disaster recovery;
- La Plata County resiliency; and
- Larimer County resiliency and disaster recovery.

Several of these communities participated in a series of workshops to develop resiliency frameworks. These include:

Arvada;

- Bayfield;
- Durango;
- Ignacio;
- La Plata County, which involved multiple communities; and
- Southern Ute Tribe.

The Office's Resilient Colorado Communities workshop consists of two parts and takes a systems-level approach to challenges that communities face. This workshop targets a diverse set of stakeholders, including business owners, government staff, elected officials, community groups and non-profit organizations. The Office's endeavors in this area have resulted in four county<sup>22</sup> and two municipal<sup>23</sup> resiliency frameworks.

Additionally, the Office is developing technical toolkits to assist local communities in developing pre-disaster ordinances and plans, in addition to long-term recovery planning. These toolkits first became publicly available on the Office's website in June 2021.

Further, the Office provided long-term recovery guidance and technical assistance to DOLA-funded local recovery managers in Huerfano and Costilla Counties following the 2018 Spring Fire, and in Grand County as part of the recovery from the East Troublesome Fire in 2020.

In addition, since 2017, the Office has led multiple group meetings and workshops, reaching over 5,000 individuals. These meetings have included, but are not limited to:

- 19 conference presentations,
- 13 workshops,
- 23 webinars,
- 4 lectures, and
- 14 other types of presentations.

Office staff has presented at state and national conferences sponsored by the American Planning Association's annual conference, the Colorado Emergency Management Association annual conference, the Basalt Chamber of Commerce and the American Institute of Architects Colorado Chapter Resilience Committee, among others.

Between May 2020 and August 2021, the Office hosted 23 webinars. One series of 14 webinars was offered between May and October 2020 and July and August 2021 to address COVID-19 recovery and funding. Topics included:

- Setting Up Local Recovery and Resiliency Teams;
- Budgeting Strategies for Challenging Times;
- Reimagine Main Street: Open for Business;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> These were Boulder, El Paso, La Plata and Larimer Counties.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> These were Durango and Arvada.

- Local Government COVID-19 Financial Resources: Choose Your Adventure!;
- Identifying Current Impacts and Future Needs;
- Inclusive and Equitable Public Health Engagement;
- Choose Your Coronavirus Relief Fund Adventure: Part 2;
- Living it and Feeling it: Understanding and Supporting Behavioral Health in Disasters;
- Continuity of Operations Planning for Local Governments;
- COVID-19 Long-term Recovery Planning;
- COVID-19 Recovery Funding for Workforce Development;
- COVID-19 Recovery Funding for Economy and Business;
- COVID-19 Recovery Funding Community Development and Housing; and
- COVID-19 Recovery Funding for Mental Health and Human Services.

This series attracted over 1,300 attendees from 106 local communities. Additionally, as of August 2021, recordings were viewed another 434 times.

Another series of nine webinars was offered between November 2020 and August 2021 to address climate change. Topics included:

- San Miguel Clean Energy Projects;
- Energy Cost Savings for Existing Buildings;
- Climate Action Planning;
- Climate Smart Land Use Planning and Development;
- Planning and Support for Transportation Electrification;
- New Buildings: Energy Efficiency, Building Codes;
- Energy Resiliency Through Microgrids;
- Embedding Climate Equity in Your Community; and
- Efficiency and Sustainability in Water Treatment Plants.

This series attracted 524 attendees from 80 local communities. Additionally, as of August 2021, recordings were viewed another 26 times.

Lectures have included those to undergraduate and graduate students at both the University of Colorado Denver and the University of Colorado Boulder.

Finally, in March 2021, the Office received a \$2.3 million grant from the U.S. Economic Development Administration, plus an additional \$900,000 in matching funds from DOLA's Community Development Office's Main Street Program, to provide technical assistance to local communities in developing COVID-19 Regional Resiliency and Recovery Roadmaps. As part of this two-year effort, the Office will provide technical assistance to 16 rural teams representing over 160 local jurisdictions, which will create roadmaps to accelerate communities toward resilient economic futures.

#### Peer Exchanges

In fiscal year 20-21 alone, the Office hosted 24 peer exchange meetings, reaching 200 participants from approximately 60 communities from across the state.

These consisted of two groups:

- COVID-19 meetings, held every two weeks, had an average of 36 participants; and
- Wildfire Recovery meetings, held once per month, had an average of 19 participants.

During these meetings, the Office frequently brought in experts to speak on topics of interest to the participants. These meetings continue to offer a forum within which participants share ideas and best practices and brainstorm on approaches to pressing issues.

Additionally, the Office has plans to launch a new series of peer exchanges to implement its new Regional Resiliency and Recovery Roadmap program. In June 2021, a peer exchange portal became available to local jurisdictions to offer an online, password-protected forum for exchange between the recurring live calls.

#### **Grants**

Since July 2019, the Office has managed the REDI grant program, which seeks to help rural communities diversify their economies with projects that seek to create a more resilient Colorado. Projects aim to boost job creation and retention, capacity building, economic resilience and entrepreneurial ecosystems.

Table 3 illustrates, for the fiscal years indicated, the number of REDI grants that have been awarded since fiscal year 16-17, along with the number of counties receiving grants and the total dollar value of those grants.

Table 3
REDI Grants Awarded

Fiscal Year	Number of Grants Awarded	Number of Counties Receiving Grants	Total Value of Grants Awarded
16-17	16	15	\$737,639
17-18	14	11	\$724,000
18-19	22	18	\$782,005
19-20	14	11	\$617,900
20-21	15	11	\$765,185
TOTAL	81	66	\$3,626,729

Prior to fiscal year 19-20, DOLA administered the REDI grant program through another section of the DLG. However, since that time, under the Office's administration of the program, 19 REDI grants have been awarded, totaling approximately \$1.4 million. A complete breakdown of REDI grants awarded can be found in Appendix A.

Additionally, the Office has assisted at least two other grant programs on integrating resiliency criteria into their programs.

The Office assisted other DOLA staff on integrating resiliency criteria into the Energy/Mineral Impact Assistance Fund grant program application so that applicants build resiliency into their projects.

The Office assisted DHSEM in developing a process to prioritize resiliency criteria to score and prioritize projects submitted to the Federal Emergency Management Agency's (FEMA's) Building Resilient Infrastructure and Communities grant program.

Finally, in 2018, the Office, along with the Colorado Water Conservation Board (CWCB) and DHSEM, recognized that there were multiple tools available to mitigate the impacts of hazards such as land-use regulations, infrastructure investments, community education and engagement. However, there was no method to quantify the state's existing and future risk to climate hazards, such as drought, flood and wildfire, or the potential savings from strategic resilience actions.

As a result, these agencies conducted a feasibility assessment, developed a scope of work for the Future Conditions Modeling Project, and then secured a grant of \$650,750 (to which the CWCB contributed an additional \$249,250 in matching funds) from FEMA. The project ultimately resulted in the Future Avoided Costs Explorer (FACE): Hazards Tool, which is intended to assist Colorado communities in making informed decisions to address current and future hazard risks caused by climate change. Notably, this tool has gained national recognition.

#### Interagency Collaboration and Coordination

In addition to the two peer exchanges discussed earlier, the Office leads an additional five interagency groups:

- Colorado Resiliency Working Group—this group serves as a sort of steering committee and implementing body of the Colorado Resiliency Framework. It comprises representatives from federal, state and local agencies, along with other partners. It meets on a quarterly basis.
- Rural Economic Adaptations and Futures Committee—this group focuses on the economic concerns of the state's rural communities. It meets every other week.
- Colorado Climate Staff—this multiagency team meets every other week and coordinates the state's climate initiatives. Office staff is part of the core leadership group.
- Long Term Recovery Working Group—this group, consisting of participants from across state government, meets on an as needed basis to assist communities with long-term recovery efforts.
- Community and Economic Recovery Working Group—this group, consisting of participants from across state government, meets on an as-needed basis to assist with community and economic recovery efforts.

The Office also participates in an additional five interagency groups, providing the Office's expertise in resiliency planning and collaboration:

- State Hazard Mitigation Team,
- State Recovery Task Force,
- Drought Task Force,
- Regional Air Quality Council, and
- Economic Development Council of Colorado.

Additionally, every other week, the Office coordinates briefings from multiple state agencies to local governments regarding COVID-19 response and recovery efforts. On average, there are just over 100 attendees on each call.

As part of the collective efforts of multiple state agencies, several resiliency tools and best practices have been developed, with the Office playing a leading or supporting role advancing these resources:

- DOLA's Planning for Hazards: Land Use Solutions for Colorado Guide,
- DOLA's Watershed Resilience Program,
- Department of Natural Resources' (DNR's) Colorado Hazard Mapping Program,
- Department of Transportation's (CDOT's) I-70 Risk and Resilience Pilot, and
- Department of Public Safety's integration of resiliency prioritization criteria into grant reviews.

Finally, the Office led the effort to develop the *Colorado Resiliency Playbook* and the Colorado Resiliency Resource Center.

#### Newsletters

In May 2020, the Office increased the frequency of its electronic newsletter from quarterly to monthly. As of March 2021, the newsletter was distributed to 789 individuals, which represents a 36 percent increase in distribution from the prior year.

#### Websites

The Office maintains two distinct websites: coresiliency.com and planningforhazards.com.

The Office's main website, coresiliency.com, has information relating to the Office's mission, various programs offered by the Office and technical assistance. Between the COVID-19 pandemic and the 2020 wildfires, 151 percent more users utilized this site compared to the previous 15-month period.

The planningforhazards.com website, created with a Community Development Block Grant—Resilience Planning grant by the DLG in 2016, serves as the home of the *Planning for Hazards: Land Use Solutions for Colorado Guide*, among other things. The Office, along with a steering committee, partners with Texas A&M University, which maintains the website. It was accessed by 65 percent more users in the first quarter of 2021 compared to the same quarter in 2020.

#### Frameworks and Playbooks

In 2015, the Office released the *Colorado Resiliency Framework (Framework 2015)*, which provided a roadmap for local communities to begin resiliency planning.

In 2019, the Office managed the Colorado Resiliency Institutionalization Project, which culminated in the release of the *Colorado Resiliency Playbook* to assist state agencies in their efforts to institutionalize resiliency principles and practices into their operations.

In 2020, the Office updated *Framework 2015* with the *Colorado Resiliency Framework 2020 (Framework 2020)*, which addresses risks and vulnerabilities across four themes:

- Adapting to a changing climate,
- Understanding risks from natural and other hazards,
- · Addressing social inequities and unique community needs, and
- Pursuing economic diversity and vibrancy.

Framework 2020 establishes six resiliency priorities:

- Future-Ready Economy and Workforce,
- Climate and Natural Hazard Resiliency,
- Building and Infrastructure Sustainability,
- Agriculture and Food Security,
- Housing Attainability, and
- Community Capacity.

The Office will facilitate the Colorado Resiliency Working Group's implementation of these priorities by coordinating and implementing resiliency activities, convening diverse stakeholders to create opportunities for education and information-sharing, overseeing and coordinating performance monitoring and empowering partners to integrate resiliency into their daily lives and businesses.

#### **Colorado Resiliency Working Group**

The fifth sunset criterion questions whether the composition of the agency's board or commission adequately represents the public interest and whether the agency encourages public participation in its decisions rather than participation only by the people it regulates.

In part, COPRRR utilizes this section of the report to evaluate the program according to this criterion.

The Colorado Resiliency Working Group (Working Group) is an informal body formed by the Office to serve as a sort of peer exchange between the Office and other, mostly governmental organizations. Although its membership fluctuates, it generally consists of representatives from various state agencies, federal agencies and other partner organizations.

The Working Group typically meets once per quarter and serves as an informal steering committee for the Office. Additionally, the Working Group assisted in the development of and is helping to implement the strategies outlined in *Framework 2020*.

#### **COVID-19 Response**

The COVID-19 pandemic placed extraordinary pressures on the citizens of Colorado, the Colorado economy and Colorado state government. As a result, COPRRR asked the Office to summarize any measures the agency may have implemented in response to the COVID-19 pandemic, the results of those efforts and any lessons learned. This section of the report is intended to provide a high-level summary of those responses.

The Office implemented many COVID-19-specific programs, including:

- Created a series of COVID-19 recovery web pages with important resources and information for local communities;
- Increased the frequency of the Office's newsletter from quarterly to monthly, and included COVID-19 recovery information;
- Hosted a series of webinars dedicated to COVID-19 recovery;
- Hosted a series of webinars dedicated specifically to COVID-19 recovery funding opportunities;
- Hosted a peer exchange dedicated to COVID-19 response;
- Launched a peer exchange online forum where local communities can connect and share ideas and resources related to local recovery efforts;
- Organized coordination calls every other week with state agencies and local governments;
- Developed and implemented the COVID-19 Regional Resiliency and Recovery Roadmap program;
- Created a resource guide for local governments pertaining to COVID-19 recovery funding;
- Created the Rural Economic Adaptation and Future's Committee to share innovations and solutions to economic shocks and stressors among state agencies, local communities and the non-profit community; and
- Developed an online COVID-19 Community Adaptation Hub to share best practices in recovery response across the state.

Both the Office and COPRRR have received positive feedback from stakeholders regarding these endeavors, many of which can serve as models for responses to future crises.

## **Analysis and Recommendations**

The final sunset criterion questions whether administrative and statutory changes are necessary to improve agency operations to enhance the public interest. The recommendations that follow are offered in consideration of this criterion, in general, and any criteria specifically referenced in those recommendations.

## Recommendation 1 - Continue the Colorado Resiliency Office for 15 years, until 2037.

The first sunset criterion questions whether regulation is necessary to protect the public health, safety and welfare. While the Colorado Resiliency Office (Office) is not a regulatory program, it is still reasonable to question whether the Office performs a function that is necessary to protect the public. In short, does a resilient Colorado serve to protect the public?

As early as 2010, the U.S. government recognized that "resilience has always been at the heart of the American spirit."<sup>24</sup>

Just two years later, the National Research Council found

Natural and human-induced disasters carry with them the potential for injuries and death, displacement of people, loss of homes and land, disruptions in transportation, business interruption, job losses, and greater demand on federal, state, and local resources. Against the backdrop of the nation's aging infrastructure, inconsistent adoption and enforcement of building codes, and health and economic disparities, the future impacts of global population growth and movement, complex interdependent global commerce and economic systems, and changing climate demand greater resilience to disasters to help decrease disaster-related losses and to increase the nation's physical, social, cultural, economic, and environmental health.<sup>25</sup>

As these disasters become more frequent and of increasingly larger magnitudes, the conversation around resiliency has never been more salient.

Created in 2014, in the wake of historic floods and wildfires, the Office was charged first with responding to those historic events, and then, by the time it moved from the Governor's Office to the Department of Local Affairs (DOLA) in 2018, developing strategies to make the state more resilient in the future.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> The White House, "National Security Strategy," May 2010, p. 19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> National Research Council, *Disaster Resilience: A National Imperative*, 2012, The National Academies Press, p. 209.

The Office works to help communities be adaptive to changing conditions by incorporating resiliency into planning processes and projects, helping communities understand the shocks and stressors they face, establishing a resiliency vision and goals, leveraging and aligning community plans and developing and implementing resiliency strategies.

To accomplish this mission, the statutes creating the Office lay out at least eight distinct tasks for the Office. It is reasonable to examine the Office's progress relative to each task to assess the success of the Office.

Task #1: Develop a plan to improve coordination among state agencies and local jurisdictions to support community and economic recovery efforts and to address risk and vulnerability reduction.<sup>26</sup>

Perhaps one of the Office's signature achievements was the development of the original *Colorado Resiliency Framework* in 2015, which was most recently updated in 2020 (*Framework 2020*). These documents create paths for local communities to follow on their journeys to creating greater resiliency. The Office facilitates the Colorado Resiliency Working Group (Working Group), comprising representatives from various state and federal agencies, as well as other partner organizations. The Working Group meets quarterly to coordinate implementation of *Framework 2020* and other resiliency efforts.

Additionally, one of the Office's more popular programs has been its peer exchanges, where local communities share their experiences and learn from one another. The Office has convened two such exchanges, one focused on COVID-19 and one focused on wildfire recovery.

In the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic, the Office has also coordinated, through webinars and bi-weekly calls, the dissemination of information pertaining to recovery funding to local communities.

However, resiliency is a long-term process, and the Office has plans to update *Framework 2020* on a five-year cycle. Thus, the journey toward a more resilient Colorado has begun, but is not yet complete.

With increased capacity, the Office could dedicate a staff person to providing local communities with more comprehensive technical assistance.

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> § 24-32-122(1)(a)(I), C.R.S.

Task #2: Provide technical assistance to local governments for the implementation of resilience planning, including resilience frameworks, vulnerability profiles, risk-reduction plans, and economic development strategies.<sup>27</sup>

Although technical assistance can take many forms—from formal workshops and programs to phone calls—it generally consists of providing expertise to achieve a goal, as well as providing resources or connecting people to the resources to help them achieve that goal.

Some of the Office's more formal work in this area has been the Community Resilience Planning Workshop, which led to the creation of resilience frameworks in several local communities.

The Office is also involved in the state's Just Transition initiative and will play a role in supporting community implementation strategies.

In response to the COVID-19 pandemic, the Office developed the COVID-19 Recovery and Resiliency Roadmaps for rural regional teams and led community and economic recovery efforts through the creation of the Community Adaptation Hub, Community Adaptation Guide, long-term recovery toolkits and recovery webinars.

One of the Office's more popular programs has been its peer exchanges, where local communities share their experiences and learn from one another. The Office has convened two such exchanges, one focused on COVID-19 and one focused on wildfire recovery.

The Office also developed resilience planning toolkits to assist local communities with resilience, pre-disaster and post-disaster issues.

The Office, as one stakeholder put it, is a sort of concierge in this regard, connecting local communities with the resources they need to meet their goals.

In the end, the Office has provided high-level guidance, webinars and peer exchanges, but lacks the capacity to provide in-depth technical assistance and proactive local programming to meet the growing needs of local communities.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> § 24-32-122(1)(a)(II), C.R.S.

Task #3: Provide technical assistance to state agencies for the implementation of resilience policies and procedures and to institutionalize resilience practices across departments and agencies.<sup>28</sup>

To assist state agencies in their efforts to institutionalize resilience, the Office developed the *Colorado Resiliency Playbook* in 2019. Work on this task has been, perhaps, one of the Office's larger challenges. It can be difficult to persuade state agencies to work with one another. Nonetheless, as of the writing of this sunset report, the Office is in the process of developing the *Resiliency Playbook 2.0*.

While it is not known how many state agencies have incorporated resiliency principles into their operations and missions, at least three have done so. For example, the Colorado Department of Transportation is working resiliency into its work in terms of physical assets and the organization. The Colorado Department of Agriculture (CDA) is working with local conservation districts on issues such as soil health. The Colorado Water Conservation Board is taking *Framework 2020* into consideration as it updates the Colorado Water Plan.

This task represents a great opportunity for the state to lead the way on making itself more resilient, yet more state agencies must first recognize the importance of the endeavor. However, the Office lacks the capacity to be more proactive in this area, and once state agencies recognize the importance of resiliency, the Office lacks the capacity to provide in-depth technical assistance to them.

Task #4: Provide technical assistance to local governments and state agencies to secure additional resources and investment to implement resilience solutions.<sup>29</sup>

The Rural Economic Development Initiative (REDI) grant program, administered by the Office since 2019, provides money and technical assistance to support rural economic development and resiliency. Since taking over this program, the Office has awarded approximately \$1.4 million to rural communities under 19 grants. In 2021, the General Assembly dedicated \$5 million in state stimulus funding to the REDI grant program.

Additionally, in summer 2021, the Office was awarded a \$2.3 million grant from the U.S. Economic Development Administration to provide technical assistance to local communities in support of their COVID-19 recovery efforts through the development of regional rural roadmaps.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> § 24-32-122(1)(a)(III), C.R.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> § 24-32-122(1)(a)(IV), C.R.S.

Further, the Office has provided resources on its website and, as of the writing of this sunset report, is exploring the feasibility of developing a resiliency fund.

In the end, the Office has made some progress on this task, but could likely leverage more federal and private funding to build resiliency capacity for Colorado if the Office had additional resources to dedicate to such endeavors.

Task #5: Integrate resilience criteria into existing competitive grant programs.<sup>30</sup>

The creation of the *Colorado Resiliency Playbook* represents general progress on this task, and the *Resiliency Playbook 2.0* should further this progress.

In addition, the Office worked with the Division of Homeland Security and Emergency Management (DHSEM) to build resiliency into its Pre-disaster Mitigation and Building Resilient Infrastructure and Communities (BRIC) programs. The Office also worked with DOLA to incorporate resiliency into the Energy/Mineral Impact Assistance Fund grant program.

Finally, CDA is working resiliency concepts into its conservation programs.

While this is a laudable task, in the end, it may be difficult to achieve with many federal grants, which frequently have very specific requirements that simply lack the flexibility to account for resiliency. Regardless, if the Office had adequate resources, it could provide technical assistance to state agencies as they design their various grant programs.

Task #6: Provide policy advocacy to shape federal resilience efforts.<sup>31</sup>

When the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) was developing its BRIC program, the Office provided comments on resiliency planning policy.

The Office also provides input on federal resilience efforts through the Council of State Community Development Agencies.

Additionally, the Office participates in the U.S Climate Alliance's Resiliency Working Group, which undertakes federal policy advocacy.

Finally, the Office is part of the Colorado Recovery and Resiliency

20

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> § 24-32-122(1)(a)(V), C.R.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> § 24-32-122(1)(a)(VI), C.R.S.

Collaborative, which makes policy recommendations to Colorado legislators.

In the end, this task presents the Office with opportunities to do more, if it had sufficient resources.

Task #7: Develop metrics and targets to measure the short- and long-term success of resilience efforts and actions.<sup>32</sup>

The importance of this task cannot be overstated. Policymakers have legitimate reason to want to measure whether the funds and resources invested in resiliency planning are well placed. Metrics allow targets to be established and create clear goals for improvement.<sup>33</sup>

However, developing metrics around resiliency is particularly challenging because, in short, it requires measuring the savings realized by something that did not happen.

According to the National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine, this challenge is not unique to Colorado, but rather to all resiliency planning:

[D]espite the growth and investment in resilience efforts, resilience science and measurement still lag behind resilience practice.<sup>34</sup>

Indeed,

Because resilience measurement is still in its infancy, most of the efforts that have been developed and implemented to date have had limited application and impact.<sup>35</sup>

Although measuring resilience can be challenging, the Office continues to strive to find ways to develop metrics. Most notably, *Framework 2020* provides a path for communities to follow and creates tangible relevance that will eventually be measurable. Some examples include the development of a resiliency dashboard, as well as the development of a community resiliency assessment and action guide.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> § 24-32-122(1)(a)(VII), C.R.S.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> National Research Council, *Disaster Resilience: A National Imperative*, 2012, The National Academies Press, p. 92.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine (2019), "Building and Measuring Community Resilience: Actions for Communities and the Gulf Research Program," The National Academies Press, p. 21.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine (2019), "Building and Measuring Community Resilience: Actions for Communities and the Gulf Research Program," The National Academies Press, p. 38.

Clearly, this is one task where much remains to be done, and additional resources would aid in such endeavors.

Task #8: Support long-term community recovery efforts and resource navigation after a disaster.<sup>36</sup>

With regard to long-term recovery efforts, the floods and wildfires in 2012 and 2013 that led to the creation of the Office spawned recovery efforts that continue to this day. Those efforts include activities such as local government coordination calls, technical assistance, resource navigation and partnership development.

With regard to post-disaster resource navigation, most stakeholders agree that the Office has done a superb job. Some highlights include:

2018 fire recovery efforts in Huerfano and Costilla Counties involved the Office coordinating and funding recovery managers with funds from the Division of Local Government (DLG) and DHSEM; working directly with recovery managers in those communities to develop and implement recovery plans; navigating federal and state resources and hosting a post-disaster debriefing session to identify recovery gaps.

2019 avalanche recovery efforts in Lake City and Hinsdale County involved the Office providing business continuity planning, resource navigation and technical assistance.

2020 fire recovery efforts in Grand and Larimer Counties involved the Office providing support to local recovery task forces. Additionally, the Office is providing technical assistance to the Grand County fire recovery manager, which is funded by the DLG.

2020 COVID-19 pandemic efforts involved the Office developing a COVID resource page on its website that includes a webinar series, peer exchange and a community adaptation hub, among other things. The Office's efforts surrounding COVID-19 led some stakeholders to conclude that the Office has been invaluable in helping small communities, communities that lack the necessary resources and that may not have any full-time employees, address the complexities of responding to the COVID-19 pandemic.

Additionally, the Office launched a redesigned website in 2021 with additional resources and functionality to aid in the advancement of resiliency and long-term recovery.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> § 24-32-122(1)(a)(VIII), C.R.S.

Thus, the Office has accomplished a lot with respect to this task, but one thing remains. Long-term recovery is just that, long-term. As the 2012 and 2013 wildfires and floods demonstrate, long-term recovery can involve not just years, but decades.

Complicating this is the fact that disasters continue to occur, which requires the Office to redeploy its limited resources to address the immediate need. As a result, long-term, proactive measures, the hallmarks of resiliency, tend to be pushed aside.

The above analysis, indeed this entire sunset report, clearly demonstrates that the Office has accomplished much. However, unless one concludes that Colorado is now truly resilient, much remains to be done.

The first sunset criterion requires an analysis as to whether the Office is necessary to protect the public. While it may not be necessary, it is desirable. The Office may well be the only organ of state government that is proactively looking at what the state will need in 10 or more years. It is not merely reactive; it strives to be proactive as well.

As disasters continue to occur, the services of the Office will continue to be called upon. The Office is the concierge for local governments in accessing that often-sought single point of contact in state government that will connect them with state and federal resources in times of dire need.

The federal government recently recognized the need for resiliency and disaster mitigation planning when it announced, in August 2021, a round of grants to states totaling \$3.5 billion to aid in such endeavors.<sup>37</sup>

Since resiliency is a long-term effort, 15 years is an appropriate amount of time to continue the Office.

For all these reasons, the General Assembly should continue the Office for 15 years, until 2037.

## Administrative Recommendation 1 - The Office should seek funding for additional staff.

The third sunset criterion questions, among other things, whether the operations of the agency under review are impeded or enhanced by budgetary, resource or personnel matters.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Christopher Flavelle, "Biden announces record climate resilience funding," *The Denver Post*, August 6, 2021, p. A10.

Throughout the course of this sunset review, stakeholders observed the breadth of the work performed by the small staff of the Office. Indeed, the Program Description of this report and Recommendation 1 enumerate a great many deeds accomplished by the handful of full-time employees of the Office. They have accomplished much with very few.

However, the task of building resiliency is long. With such a small staff, the Office too often finds itself responding to one disaster after another, with little capacity left to invest in the efforts of long-term resilience and recovery. In short, the Colorado Resiliency Office has a difficult time being resilient.

If the General Assembly finds that resiliency is worth the effort and continues the Office, as is advocated in Recommendation 1, then the Office should provide the General Assembly with an honest assessment of the resources it needs to adequately perform the functions assigned to it by the General Assembly and seek those resources through the budgetary process.

# Appendix A -- Rural Economic Development Initiative (REDI) Grants

In July 2019, the Colorado Resiliency Office assumed responsibility for administering the Rural Economic Development Initiative (REDI) grant program, which had previously been administered by a different unit within the Department of Local Affairs' Division of Local Government. The table below provides a high-level synopsis of the grants awarded, to whom they were awarded and the dollar value attached to each.

#### Rural Economic Development Initiative Awards FY 2016 to Date

2020-2021 Cycle			
Applicant	County	Project Name	Final award
SWCCOG		Towoac NEPA Project	\$86,000
San Juan County	San Juan County	Silverton Science and Innovation Project	\$32,953
Town of Hayden	Routt County	Co-working Space	\$150,000
City of La Junta	Otero County	Economic Action Plan	\$25,000
City of Lamar	Prowers County	Main Cafe Construction Documents	\$61,005
City of Durango	La Plata County	Rural Resiliency and Recruitment Strategy	\$52,947
City of Craig	Moffat County	Economic Development Staff Capacity	\$123,750
City of Bennett	Arapahoe County	Support and Recruitment Strategy	\$25,000
Town of Firestone	Weld County	Old Town Firestone Sub-Area Plan	\$20,000
Canon City	Fremont County	Marketing and Analysis Plan	\$42,250
Town of Berthoud	Larimer County	Market Analysis	\$8,750
Town of Mead	Weld County	3rd St and Welker Ave Intersection	\$50,000
San Juan County	San Juan County	Economic Development and Diversification Coordinator	\$85,000
City of Rocky Ford	Otero County	Developing a Resilient Economy	\$18,850
Costilla County	Costilla County	San Luis Small Business Center	\$10,190
Total 2020-2021			\$795,185

2019-2020 Cycle				
Applicant	County	Project Name	Final award	
San Miguel County	San Miguel County	Meat Processing Feasibility Study	\$35,000	
Town of Collbran	Mesa County	Downtown Improvement Project	\$10,000	
Town of Platteville	Weld County	Economic Development Strategic Plan	\$20,000	
City of Salida	Chaffee County	Hot Springs Aquatic Center Economic Study	\$24,000	
Town of Oak Creek	Routt County	Oak Creek Mountain Park	\$100,000	
Kit Carson County	Kit Carson County	Strategic Growth Plan	\$29,200	
Town of Buena Vista	Chaffee County	STEM Incubator	\$46,300	
Town of San Luis	Costilla County	San Luis Town Plaza	\$33,900	
Town of Hayden	Routt County	Business Incentive Grant Program	\$85,000	
Region 10	Montrose County	Town of Olathe Business Development Implementation	\$27,000	
Region 10	Delta County	Town of Hotchkiss Prosperity Plan Implementation	\$28,000	
City of Lamar	Prowers County	Main Cafe Acquisition	\$13,500	
City of Brush	Morgan County	Agri Park Expansion Phase 2	\$118,000	
SWCCOG		Broadband Middle Mile Network Phase II	\$48,000	
Total 2019-2020			\$617,900	

2018-2019 Cycle				
Applicant	County	Project Name	Final award	
Montrose County	Montrose County	Hempseed Processing Facility	\$15,000	
Town of Mancos	Montezuma County	Mancos Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy	\$22,500	
Grand County	Grand County	Integrated Economic Development and Workforce Portal	\$15,000	
Logan County	Logan County	Logan County Coworking Initiative	\$62,577	
City of Lamar	Prowers County	Consumer Spending Analysis and Retail Recruitment	\$30,000	
Custer County	Custer County	Economic Development Strategic Plan and Implementation	\$26,500	
Costilla County	Costilla County	Blanca Forestry Products Off-Road Systems Road Reconstruction	\$12,000	
Huerfano County	Huerfano County		\$25,000	
Town of Oak Creek	Routt County	Oak Creek Business Improvement Grant Program	\$52,000	
Rio Blanco County	Rio Blanco County	Rio Blanco County Broadband Marketing and Tourism Business Development Plan	\$30,000	
Region 10	Delta County	Town of Hotchkiss Economic Recovery and Diversification	\$38,000	
Region 10	Montrose County	West End Economic Recovery and Diversification	\$75,000	
Delta County School District	Delta County	Delta County School District ENGAGE Hub	\$30,628	
Gunnison County	Gunnison County	One Valley Economic Diversification and Rural Entrepreneurial Engagement	\$115,200	
Town of Kiowa	Elbert County	Kiowa Highway Traffic Study	\$49,500	
Town of Creede	Mineral County	Creed Repertory Theater LED Lighting Upgrade	\$40,000	
Lake County	Lake County	Lake County Industrial Park Engineering	\$39,500	
Chaffee County	Chaffee County	Small Business Enabler Project	\$21,600	
Town of Rico	Dolores County	Infrastructure Improvement Economic Analysis	\$8,000	
Region 10	Montrose County	Support Olathe's Business and Economic Development Strategy	\$24,000	
City of Fruita	Mesa County	Fruita Lagoon Redevelopment	\$25,000	
San Luis Valley Council of Governments	Costilla County	Opportunity Zone Prospectus	\$25,000	
Total 2018-2019			\$782,005	

2017-2018 Cycle				
Applicant	County	Project Name	Final award	
City of Brush	Morgan County	Brush! Agripark Redevelopment Infrastructure	\$150,000	
City of Craig	Moffat County	Moffat County Business Opportunity Strategy	\$55,000	
City of Delta	Delta County	Delta Riverfront Redevelopment Plan and ENGAGE Innovation Center Operations Plan	\$56,850	
City of Lamar	Prowers County	Lamar Consumer Spending Analysis and Retail Recruit	\$25,000	
City of Trinidad	Las Animas County	Trinidad La Puerta Commercial Development Infrastructure Plan	\$100,000	
Region 10	Montrose County	Olathe Economic Development Strategy	\$36,000	
Region 10	Montrose County	West End Capacity Planning	\$45,000	
Rio Grande County	Rio Grande County	Monte Vista Wastewater Treatment Facility Engineering Study	\$28,000	
Rio Grande County	Rio Grande County	Due Diligence for Rio Grande Railroad	\$40,000	
Town of Kersey	Weld County	Kersey Retail Market Analysis	\$25,650	
Town of Kiowa	Elbert County	Town of Kiowa Economic Strategic Plan	\$23,000	
Town of Oak Creek	Routt County	Oak Creek Tramway Park Development Master Plan	\$13,500	
Town of Parachute	Garfield County	Parachute Infrastructure Improvements for Economic	\$75,000	
Town of Paonia	Delta County	Paonia Space to Create - First Phase Feasibility Study	\$25,000	
Total 2017-2018			\$724,000	

2016-2017 Cycle				
Applicant	County	Project Name	Final award	
Town of Buena Vista	Chaffee County	Buena Vista Economic Vitality Strategy	\$27,500	
Custer County	Custer County	Economic Development//Business Growth Study	\$32,801	
Region 10	Delta County	Delta Catalytic Economic Development	\$70,000	
Town of Elizabeth	Elbert County	Market and Feasibility for Creative Arts Facility	\$30,000	
City of Fort Morgan	Morgan County	Retail Analytics Study and Recruitment Strategy	\$30,000	
Town of Grand Lake	Grand County	Grand Lake Event Center Business Plan	\$70,000	
Town of Holly	Prowers County	Utility Improvement for Business Attraction and Expansion	\$62,225	
Huerfano County	Huerfano County	Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy	\$40,000	
Kiowa County	Kiowa County	Strategic Design Planning for Fairground Improvement	\$16,000	
City of La Junta	Otero County	Market Analysis for Retention and Recruitment with Retail Healthcare and Tourism Sectors	\$50,000	
Lake County	Lake County	Airport Business Industrial Park Master Plan	\$28,000	
City of Lamar	Prowers County	Retail Recruitment/Development Analysis and Strategy	\$35,000	
Town of Minturn	Eagle County	Dowd Junction Utility Improvement	\$19,965	
Region 10	Montrose County	West Montrose Strategy to Leverage Tourism and Outdoor Recreation Assets	\$70,000	
Saguache County	Saguache County	Airport Feasibility Study to Attract Unmanned Aircrafts	\$40,000	
Region 10	Otero County	Economic and Planning Assistance	\$68,000	
Total 2016-2017			\$737,939	