



COLORADO

**Department of
Regulatory Agencies**

Colorado Office of Policy, Research &
Regulatory Reform

2018 Sunset Reviews:

Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Board

State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education

Colorado Emergency Planning Subcommittee

Public Safety Communications Subcommittee

Human Trafficking Council

Standing Efficiency and Accountability Committee

October 15, 2018



COLORADO

Department of
Regulatory Agencies

Executive Director's Office

October 15, 2018

Members of the Colorado General Assembly
c/o the Office of Legislative Legal Services
State Capitol Building
Denver, Colorado 80203

Dear Members of the General Assembly:

The General Assembly established a sunset review process for advisory committees and boards in 1986 as a way to analyze and evaluate their efficacy and to determine whether they should continue. Since their creation, Colorado's sunrise and sunset processes have gained national recognition and are routinely highlighted as best practices as governments seek to streamline regulation and increase efficiencies.

Section 2-3-1203(2)(b)(III), Colorado Revised Statutes, directs the Department of Regulatory Agencies to submit a report containing such analysis and evaluation to the office of legislative legal services no later than October 15 of the year preceding the date established for termination.

The Colorado Office of Policy, Research and Regulatory Reform (COPRRR), located within my office, is responsible for fulfilling these statutory mandates. Accordingly, COPRRR has completed its evaluations of the Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Board, the State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education, the Colorado Emergency Planning Subcommittee, the Public Safety Communications Subcommittee, the Human Trafficking Council, and the Standing Efficiency and Accountability Committee. I am pleased to submit this written report, which will be the basis for COPRRR's oral testimony before the 2019 legislative committees of reference.

The report discusses the effectiveness of the committees in carrying out the intention of the statutes and makes recommendations as to whether the advisory committees should be continued.

Sincerely,

Marguerite Salazar
Executive Director





COLORADO

Department of Regulatory Agencies

Colorado Office of Policy, Research &
Regulatory Reform

2018 Sunset Reviews:

Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Board

State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education

Colorado Emergency Planning Subcommittee

Public Safety Communications Subcommittee

Human Trafficking Council

Standing Efficiency and Accountability Committee

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Continue the Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Board.

The Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Review Board, located within the Department of Education, provides a venue for collaboration between local education providers and institutions of higher education in order to increase accessibility and strengthen participation of Colorado's students within the state's available concurrent enrollment programs. The advisory board has also developed work sessions and online reference materials as a means of expanding access to concurrent enrollment opportunities.

Continue the State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education.

The State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education, located within the Department of Education, serves as an intermediary and works with state agencies, statewide organizations, non-profit organizations, and parents in order to share best practices and additional strategies to increase parental involvement in Colorado's schools. The advisory council has developed training content and promoted outreach to further its legislatively mandated goals.

Continue the Colorado Emergency Planning Subcommittee.

The Colorado Emergency Planning Committee, located within the Department of Public Safety, is a federally mandated committee that works to provide technical assistance, training, and support for local emergency preparedness committees. The committee also provides a forum for discussion for both local and state government entities, as well as nonprofit organizations to promote and strengthen statewide emergency preparedness.

Continue the Public Safety Communications Subcommittee.

The Public Safety Communications Subcommittee, located within the Department of Public Safety, works with the public safety communications network and other public safety organizations to provide feedback, recommendations, and research in order to strengthen public safety interoperable communications in Colorado. The subcommittee has also developed training and outreach opportunities through its annual Radio Summit Conference.

Continue the Human Trafficking Council.

The Human Trafficking Council, located within the Department of Public Safety, provides a forum for collaboration and coordination among state agencies, statewide service organizations, victim advocates and task forces through its training, outreach, research, and public awareness campaign. The Human Trafficking Council strives to increase access to victims’ services and strengthen prosecution tools with the goal of the elimination of human trafficking in Colorado.

Sunset the Standing Efficiency and Accountability Committee.

The Standing Efficiency and Accountability Committee, located within the Department of Transportation, was legislatively mandated to review the key findings of the Funding Advancements for Surface Transportation and Economic Recovery (FASTER) audit, and to provide recommendations to increase efficiency and address compliance issues within the Colorado Department of Transportation. As a result of these findings, the committee has made recommendations to the Transportation Legislation Review Committee and provided a presentation at the annual Smart Act hearing.

MAJOR CONTACTS MADE DURING THESE REVIEWS

Colorado Department of Education
Colorado Department of Public Safety, Division of Homeland Security and Emergency Management
Colorado Department of Public Safety, Division of Criminal Justice
Colorado Department of Transportation

What is a Sunset Review?

A sunset review is a periodic assessment of state boards, programs, and functions to determine whether they should be continued by the legislature. Sunset reviews focus on creating the least restrictive form of regulation consistent with protecting the public. In formulating recommendations, sunset reviews consider the public’s right to consistent, high quality professional or occupational services and the ability of businesses to exist and thrive in a competitive market, free from unnecessary regulation.

Sunset Reviews are prepared by:
Colorado Department of Regulatory Agencies
Colorado Office of Policy, Research and Regulatory Reform
1560 Broadway, Suite 1550, Denver, CO 80202
www.dora.colorado.gov/opr



Table of Contents

- Background1**
 - Introduction.....1
 - Sunset Process1
- Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Board2**
 - Creation, Mission and Make-Up2
 - Responsibilities of the Advisory Board3
 - Revenues and Expenditures3
 - Meetings of the Advisory Board4
 - Proposals and Their Status.....4
 - Reasons for Continuation5
 - Analysis and Recommendation5
- State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education.....6**
 - Creation, Mission and Make-Up6
 - Responsibilities of the Advisory Council7
 - Revenues and Expenditures8
 - Meetings of the Advisory Council9
 - Proposals and Their Status.....9
 - Reasons for Continuation 11
 - Analysis and Recommendation 12**
- Colorado Emergency Planning Subcommittee 13**
 - Creation, Mission and Make-Up 13
 - Responsibilities of the Planning Committee 14
 - Revenues and Expenditures 14
 - Meetings of the Planning Committee..... 15
 - Proposals and Accomplishments 15
 - Reasons for Continuation 16
 - Analysis and Recommendation 16
- Public Safety Communications Subcommittee..... 17**
 - Creation, Mission and Make-Up 17
 - Responsibilities of the Communications Subcommittee 18
 - Revenues and Expenditures 19
 - Meetings of the Communications Subcommittee 19

Proposals and Their Status.....	19
Reasons for Continuation	20
Analysis and Recommendation	20
Colorado Human Trafficking Council.....	21
Creation, Mission and Make-Up	21
Responsibilities of the Human Trafficking Council	24
Revenues and Expenditures	25
Meetings of the Human Trafficking Council	26
Proposals and Their Status.....	26
Reasons for Continuation	31
Analysis and Recommendation	31
Standing Efficiency and Accountability Committee	32
Creation, Mission and Make-Up	32
Responsibilities of the Accountability Committee	33
Revenues and Expenditures	33
Meetings of the Accountability Committee	34
Proposals and Their Status.....	34
Reasons for Sunset	35
Analysis and Recommendation	35

Background

Introduction

As part of the sunset review of an advisory committee, the advisory committee that is scheduled to repeal must submit to the Department of Regulatory Agencies, through the Colorado Office of Policy, Research and Regulatory Reform (COPRRR), on or before July 1 of the year preceding the year in which the advisory committee is scheduled to repeal:¹

- The names of current members of the advisory committee;
- All revenues and all expenditures, including advisory committee expenses, *per diem* paid to members, and any travel expenses;
- The dates all advisory committee meetings were held and the number of members attending the meetings;
- A listing of all advisory proposals made by the advisory committee, together with an indication as to whether each proposal was acted upon, implemented or enacted into statute; and
- The reasons why the advisory committee should be continued.

Importantly, sunset reviews of advisory committees do not, generally, analyze the underlying program to which the committee is expected to render advice or recommendations. If an advisory committee is sunset, the underlying program will continue.

Sunset Process

As with sunset reviews of programs, agency officials and other stakeholders can submit input regarding an advisory committee through a variety of means, including at www.dora.colorado.gov/opr.

The Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Board, the State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education, and the Standing Efficiency and Accountability Committee shall terminate on July 1, 2019, and the Colorado Emergency Planning Committee, the Public Safety Communications Subcommittee, and the Human Trafficking Council, shall terminate on September 1, 2019, unless continued by the General Assembly. It is the duty of COPRRR to conduct an analysis and evaluation of these advisory committees pursuant to section 2-3-1203, Colorado Revised Statutes.

The purpose of this review is to determine whether these committees should be continued for the protection of the public and to evaluate their performance. COPRRR's findings and recommendations are submitted via this report to the legislative committees of reference of the Colorado General Assembly.

¹ §§ 2-3-1203(2)(b)(I) and (II), C.R.S.

Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Board

Creation, Mission and Make-Up

In 2009, the Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Board (Advisory Board) was created as a result of House Bill 09-1319, known as the Concurrent Enrollment Programs Act² (CEPA). The Advisory Board is a subordinate entity under the Colorado Department of Education (CDE), the Commissioner of Education, and the Colorado State Board of Education (State Board)³ that is legislatively mandated to provide coordination assistance between local education providers (LEPs) and postsecondary education institutions in order improve the quality and accessibility of concurrent enrollment programs for Colorado students.

CEPA offers qualifying students from grades 9 through 12 who are under 21 years old the opportunity to complete postsecondary coursework through LEPs, which include school districts, boards of cooperative services, district charter schools, or institute charter schools.⁴ Students work in tandem with their LEP to establish a plan of study needed to complete requirements necessary for graduation through concurrent enrollment in qualifying postsecondary education programs.⁵ Students may also transition into the Accelerating Students through Concurrent Enrollment (ASCENT) program, which is an accelerated path that assists students in continuing with postsecondary course enrollment following their 12th grade year for one additional year if they have completed at least 12 credit hours of postsecondary coursework prior to 12th grade.⁶

The Advisory Board consists of 14 members appointed to serve three-year terms. The members are appointed in the following manner:⁷

- Three representatives from state elementary and secondary education are appointed by the Commissioner of Education. At least one of the three representatives must represent a rural public school or school district, and at least one of the representatives must represent a school district with a lower percentage of high school graduates that have enrolled in higher education;
- Five representatives from state higher education are appointed by the Executive Director of the Department of Higher Education. Two of these members must represent the community college system, one must represent a four-year public institution of higher education, one must represent a local district college, and one must represent a technical college;
- Three representatives are appointed by the Governor. At least one of these must have experience in postsecondary counseling, admissions, and financial aid, and at least one of these must have experience in public finance and budgeting;

² §22-35-101, C.R.S.

³ § 22-35-107(1), C.R.S.

⁴ § 22-35-103(13), C.R.S.

⁵ § 22-35-104(3), C.R.S.

⁶ Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Board. *2016 Annual Report to the Education Committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives and the State Board of Education*, pg. 16. Retrieved September 17, 2018, from

https://higher.ed.colorado.gov/Publications/Reports/Enrollment/FY2016/2016_Concurrent_Enrollment_April_2017.pdf

⁷ §§ 22-35-107(2) and (3), C.R.S.

-
- Two representatives from postsecondary career and technical programs. One of these must be the director of a career and technical program within the state postsecondary system, and one must represent elementary and secondary education, appointed by the State Board for Community Colleges and Occupational Education; and
 - The Director of Accreditation and Regional Services within CDE or his/her designee.

Responsibilities of the Advisory Board

Section 22-35-107(6), Colorado Revised Statutes (C.R.S.), delineates the following responsibilities of the Advisory Board:

- Establishing guidelines for the administration of the ASCENT program;
- Providing assistance and advice to local education providers and higher education institutions with the preparation of cooperative agreements;
- Providing recommendations to the State Board, the Colorado Commission on Higher Education, and the General Assembly regarding updates and improvements to state policies of the concurrent enrollment programs. Recommendations are also required to include discussions of a “funding allocation model” and resources for local education providers to enter into cooperative agreements;
- Providing recommendations to the State Board and the Education Committees of both the House of Representatives and the Senate or other applicable committees regarding the potential of a waiver process for eligible students to participate in the ASCENT program; and
- Collaborating with CDE, the Colorado Department of Labor and Employment, community colleges, local district colleges, area technical colleges, and the Colorado Work Force Development Council to develop recommendations that will assist LEPs with the creation of cooperative agreements related to apprenticeship programs and internship programs. These recommendations were required to be made available by January 1, 2016.

Revenues and Expenditures

The Advisory Board does not receive any revenue and does not generate any expenditures. Members participate on a voluntary basis.

Meetings of the Advisory Board

Table 1 provides each meeting date and the number of attendees present per meeting.

Table 1
Advisory Board Meetings
Calendar Years 2017 and 2018

Meeting Date	Number of Members in Attendance
March 16, 2017	9
June 15, 2017	8
September 21, 2017	14
November 13, 2017	12
January 25, 2018	11
April 26, 2018	11

The members of the Advisory Board meet multiple times per year, and the average attendance of members was 11 members per meeting.

Proposals and Their Status

The Advisory Board has completed the following activities and recommendations related to its legislative mandates:

- Created several website forums in August 2017 for the sharing of information and materials relating to administrative best practices for the concurrent enrollment and ASCENT programs;
- Provided Annual Reports on Concurrent Enrollment each year from calendar years 2010 through 2017 including any available funding data to the education committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives, as well as the State Board;⁸
- Developed a work session on November 13, 2017, to provide a venue for discussion related to improvement of student data sharing. Participants included representatives of districts and charter schools, higher education, the Department of Higher Education and CDE. The goal of the work session was the development of the Annual Report on Concurrent Enrollment. Additional action items were assigned in order to continue related work through regular Advisory Board future meetings; and

⁸ Concurrent Enrollment Advisory Board. *Annual Reports to the Education Committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives and the State Board of Education, 2010-2017*. Retrieved on September 17, 2018, from <https://highered.colorado.gov/Data/Reports.aspx?keyword=concurrent>

-
- Examined and approved ASCENT materials in May 2018, including program guidelines, frequently asked questions, student application materials, and the ASCENT cooperative agreement. These items were made available on the CDE website by June 2018.

Reasons for Continuation

The Advisory Board provides a venue for collaboration between LEPs and institutions of higher education with the goal of increasing accessibility and student participation in Colorado's concurrent enrollment programs.

Analysis and Recommendation

Both LEPs and student participants in the concurrent enrollment program have steadily increased in numbers. According to Advisory Board staff, since fiscal year 11-12, student and LEP participation in concurrent enrollment programs has increased between 10 and 20 percent each year. The collaborative work facilitated by the Advisory Board will continue to be a valuable resource for higher education institutions and LEPs in their efforts to strengthen concurrent enrollment programs. For this reason, the General Assembly should continue the Advisory Board.

State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education

Creation, Mission and Make-Up

The State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education (Advisory Council) was established within the Department of Education (CDE) in 2009 as a result of Senate Bill 90 to, among other things, increase parental involvement in order to reduce achievement gaps, decrease the educational dropout rate, increase graduation rates, and increase the number of students who continue on to higher education.⁹ The Advisory Council works to support these goals through its reviews of best practices and makes applicable recommendations to educators and policy makers regarding increased parent involvement in the educational process.¹⁰

The Advisory Council consists of members appointed to serve three-year terms.¹¹ The following are a list of the Advisory Council's representatives promulgated in statute that are appointed by the State Board of Education (State Board):¹²

- Five representatives that are parents of children enrolled in a public school program or state-supported higher education that reflect student populations in the state, two of whom must also be members of an accountability committee for a school or school district;
- One representative from each of the two non-profit organizations in the state that specialize in parent involvement in underserved populations;
- One representative from a non-profit that serves parents of students with disabilities;
- One representative from a non-profit organization that works with funding providers, state agencies, and service providers to assist other organizations with providing services regarding the improvement in the health and well-being of children and their families;
- One representative of a statewide organization of teachers and parents;
- One representative of a statewide organization for school executives;
- One representative of a statewide organization that represents school district boards;
- One representative of a statewide organization for teacher representation;
- One representative of a statewide organization that represents charter schools;
- One representative of a statewide organization that represents career and college guidance counselors; and
- One representative with expertise in the field of early childhood care and education.

⁹ § 22-7-301(1), C.R.S.

¹⁰ § 22-7-301(2), C.R.S.

¹¹ § 22-7-303(4), C.R.S.

¹² § 22-7-303(2)(a), C.R.S.

In addition, the following Advisory Council members are appointed by other related departments:

- One or more representatives of CDE appointed by the Commissioner of Education;¹³
- Two representatives from the Department of Higher Education, appointed by its Executive Director;¹⁴ and
- One representative of the Department of Human Services, appointed by its Executive Director.¹⁵

The Advisory Council has also developed an executive committee and four working committee subgroups to focus on specific areas of the Advisory Council's duties. The executive committee plans the Advisory Council's meeting agendas, recommends new Advisory Council members, ensures policy implementation of the Advisory Council recommendations and reviews the Advisory Council and each working committee in their work and best practices. The executive committee meets six times per year and its membership is comprised of the Advisory Council chair, vice-chair, working committee chairs, and the CDE Family Partnership Director.

The four working committees focus on the following topics: Early Childhood, Elementary, Secondary, and Higher Education. Each member of the Advisory Council is required to participate in a working committee, and selects a working committee based upon the member's interest level and proficiency. Each working committee is co-chaired by one CDE Advisory Council member and one non-CDE Advisory Council member.

Responsibilities of the Advisory Council

Title 22, Article 7, Part 3, Colorado Revised Statutes (C.R.S.), enumerates the specific advisory duties of the Advisory Council. Specifically, the Advisory Council has been assigned the following tasks:

- Provide best practices and strategies to early childhood councils, early childhood care and education councils, public schools, school districts, the state charter school institute, CDE, the State Board, the Department of Higher Education, the Colorado Commission on Higher Education, and the governing boards for state institutions of higher education, in congruence with established national standards relating to family-school partnerships that increase parental involvement in education.¹⁶
- Provide recommendations to the State Board and the Colorado Commission on Higher Education regarding parent initiatives on a statewide level.¹⁷
- Provide training and additional resources that will assist school district accountability committees and school accountability committees with increasing

¹³ § 22-7-303(2)(b), C.R.S.

¹⁴ § 22-7-303(2)(c), C.R.S.

¹⁵ § 22-7-303(2)(d), C.R.S.

¹⁶ § 22-7-304(1), C.R.S.

¹⁷ § 22-7-304(4), C.R.S.

parental involvement, including increasing the number of parents serving on school district accountability committees and school accountability committees.¹⁸

- Identify “key indicators of successful parent engagement in education” in order to develop recommendations regarding methodology that can be utilized by CDE and the Department of Higher Education for the purpose of measuring and monitoring parental involvement within public elementary, secondary, and higher education schools in Colorado.¹⁹
- Report on or before December 31 each year to the State Board, the Colorado Commission on Higher Education, and the education committees of the Senate and House of Representatives and any other applicable committees. The Advisory Council is required to report any progress achieved regarding the promotion of parental involvement and the legislative mandates for which the Advisory Council has been tasked.²⁰
- Assist CDE with the implementation and creation of the Parent Involvement in Education Grant Program.²¹ Additionally, the Advisory Council is tasked with reviewing grant applications and assisting with the collection of gifts, grants and donations from both public and private sources to support the Parent Involvement in Education Grant Program.²²

Revenues and Expenditures

Advisory Council members do not receive compensation, but may receive reimbursement for “expenses incurred in performing their duties”²³ including travel, mileage, hotel and airfare when applicable.

The Advisory Council receives its revenue from the General Fund as was authorized in Senate Bill 13-193 (SB 193). The bill also added one position for the Director of Parent Engagement at CDE. Senate Bill 193 further amended statute to allow reimbursement of Advisory Council members for applicable expenses incurred.

In addition to the one position previously mentioned, expenditures for the Advisory Council fall into two categories: reimbursement expenses and catering for lunch-hour meetings. In fiscal year 16-17, reimbursements totaled \$2,994.80 and catering costs totaled \$1,269.12 for a total of \$4,236.92. In fiscal year 17-18, reimbursements totaled \$2,927.39 and catering costs totaled \$1,743.28 for a total of \$4,670.67.

¹⁸ § 22-7-304(3), C.R.S.

¹⁹ § 22-7-304(4), C.R.S.

²⁰ § 22-7-304(5), C.R.S.

²¹ § 22-7-305(1), C.R.S.

²² § 22-7-305(4)(b), C.R.S.

²³ § 22-7-303(6), C.R.S.

Meetings of the Advisory Council

The Advisory Council meets as often as may be required in order to accomplish its statutorily established goals.²⁴ The membership of the Advisory Council currently totals 23 members. Table 2 provides the Advisory Council's meeting dates and the number of council members in attendance at each meeting.

Table 2
Advisory Council Meetings
Fiscal Years 16-17 and 17-18

Meeting Date	Number of Council Members in Attendance
August 16, 2016	12
November 15, 2016	15
February 14, 2017	17
May 16, 2017	13
August 15, 2017	19
November 14, 2017	18
February 13, 2018	19
May 15, 2018	18

The Advisory Council generally meets four times per fiscal year, and average attendance for meetings from August 2016 to May 2018 was approximately 16 members per meeting.

Proposals and Their Status

The General Assembly provided the Advisory Council with statutory duties upon its establishment. The Advisory Council has worked in collaboration with CDE to increase discussion and participation in the strengthening of parental involvement through outreach activities and advisory tasks including:

Section 22-7-304(1), C.R.S., requires that the Advisory Council provide best practices and strategies to early childhood councils, early childhood care and education councils, public schools, school districts, the state charter school institute, CDE, the State Board, the Department of Higher Education, the Colorado Commission on Higher Education, and the governing boards for state institutions of higher education, in congruence with established national standards relating to family-school partnerships that increase parental involvement in education.

²⁴ § 22-7-303(5), C.R.S.

-
- The Advisory Council has participated in the collection and distribution of the Promising Partnerships Practices, which are the practices of schools and districts that are dedicated to increased family participation in the educational process.
 - The Advisory Council often provides feedback to further the goal of increased parental involvement to offices within CDE and other partnership organizations at each of its council meetings.

Section 22-7-304(2), C.R.S., requires that the Advisory Council provide recommendations to the State Board and the Colorado Commission on Higher Education regarding parent initiatives on a statewide level.

- The Advisory Council has not provided recommendations to the State Board to date. However, the Advisory Council provided a presentation on April 11, 2014, to the Colorado Commission on Higher Education regarding the work of the Advisory Council’s higher education working committee.²⁵

Section 22-7-304(3), C.R.S., requires that the Advisory Council provide training and additional resources that will assist school district accountability committees and school accountability committees with increasing parental involvement, including increasing the number of parents serving on school district accountability committees and school accountability committees.

- Members of each of the Advisory Council’s working committees contribute their expertise in the development of content of customized district trainings. The purpose of each training is to strengthen leadership on accountability committees throughout the state, and increase discussion and practices regarding parental involvement in education.
- The Advisory Council’s working groups contribute content to the Family-School-Community Partnerships Key, a monthly newsletter provided by CDE.
- The Advisory Council continues to make numerous presentations on a yearly basis to a variety of non-profit organizations, schools, associations, and government entities to strengthen the engagement of parents in education.²⁶

Section 22-7-304(4), C.R.S., requires that the Advisory Council identify “key indicators of successful parent engagement in education” in order to develop recommendations regarding methodology that can be utilized by CDE and the Department of Higher Education for the purpose of measuring and monitoring parental involvement within public elementary, secondary, and higher education schools in Colorado.

²⁵ State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education. *2014 Annual Report*, p.6.

²⁶ State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education. *2016 and 2017 Annual Reports*; Appendix D, p.18.

-
- The Advisory Council has worked with CDE to develop surveys to increase family engagement and strengthen partnerships between communities, schools, and families.²⁷

Section 22-7-304(5), C.R.S., requires that the Advisory Council report to the State Board, the Colorado Commission on Higher Education, the education committees of the Senate and House of Representatives, and any other applicable committees on or before December 31 each year. The Advisory Council is required to report any progress achieved regarding the promotion of parental involvement and the legislative mandates for which the Advisory Council has been tasked.

- The Advisory Council has created Annual Reports since the council's inception. All annual reports since 2013 are accessible on CDE's website.²⁸

Section 22-7-305, C.R.S., requires that the Advisory Council assist CDE with the implementation and creation of the Parent Involvement in Education Grant Program. Additionally, the Advisory Council is tasked with reviewing grant applications and assisting with the collection of gifts, grants and donations from both public and private sources to support the Parent Involvement in Education Grant Program.

- The Parent Involvement in Education Grant did not receive a legislatively mandated funding stream and is not currently operable. Therefore, the Advisory Council has not assisted with the review of applications or with the collection of additional gifts, grants, or donations.

Reasons for Continuation

The Advisory Council predominantly functions as an advisory group working closely with state agencies, statewide organizations, non-profit organizations and parent representatives to amplify the discussion of best practices and strategies for increased parental involvement in the educational process. The Advisory Council will continue to provide related feedback, presentations, and develop customized training content in the coming years to further its legislatively mandated goals.

²⁷ Colorado Department of Education. *School-Family-Partnership-Survey*. Retrieved July 30, 2018, from http://www.cde.state.co.us/uip/school_family_community_partnership_survey

²⁸ State Advisory Council for Parent Involvement in Education. *2013 through 2017 Annual Reports*. Retrieved October 1, 2018, from <http://www.cde.state.co.us/sacpie>

Analysis and Recommendation

The Advisory Council works to emphasize the importance of partnerships between schools, communities, and families, and has held feedback discussions at each of its meetings. The Advisory Council has also participated in the development of training content and statewide outreach in order to foster partnerships and promote the Advisory Council's stated objectives regarding parental participation in the educational process. In addition, the Advisory Council has been considered a model example by other states in the development of similar advisory councils. Therefore, the General Assembly should continue the Advisory Council.

Colorado Emergency Planning Subcommittee

Creation, Mission and Make-Up

The Colorado Emergency Planning Subcommittee (Planning Committee) is a permanent subcommittee established in 2014 under the Homeland Security and All-Hazards Senior Advisory Committee within the Department of Public Safety's Division of Homeland Security and Emergency Management. The Planning Committee was created in response to the Federal Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act (EPCRA) of 1986,²⁹ which was established as a preventative measure following a chemical spill in Bhopal, India that killed or severely injured more than 70,000 people. The subcommittee is tasked with the designation, coordination and supervision of local planning districts to develop emergency response preparedness plans in accordance with EPCRA.³⁰

The Planning Committee consists of 12 members. Five of the 12 members are *ex officio* representatives of government or their designees, and the remaining seven members are appointed by the Executive Director of the Department of Public Safety. The *ex officio* membership includes the following:³¹

- The Director of the Department of Public Safety's Division of Homeland Security and Emergency Management,
- The Director of the Department of Public Safety's Division of Fire Prevention and Control (DFPC),
- The Director of the Department of Local Affairs' Division of Local Government,
- The Director of the Department of Public Health and Environment's (CDPHE's) Division of Hazardous Materials and Waste Management, and
- A representative of the Colorado State Patrol in the Department of Public Safety.

The additional seven members are appointed by the Executive Director of the Department of Public Safety and serve two-year terms, but may be reappointed to serve additional terms:

- Two representatives of local government,
- Two representatives of public interest or community groups,
- One representative of a local emergency planning committee (LEPC), and
- Two representatives of affected industries.

²⁹ 42 U.S.C. 11001

³⁰ § 24-33.5-1504(1) C.R.S

³¹ § 24-33.5-1614(3.5)(b), C.R.S.

Responsibilities of the Planning Committee

The Planning Committee was created to function as the “state emergency response commission” as designated by EPCRA; the planning committee also performs specified duties as required by other applicable federal laws.³² The planning committee’s primary responsibilities include:

- Encourage the participation of LEPCs to develop broad community preparedness programs,
- Encourage state government agencies to include LEPCs in their work, and
- Facilitate and encourage increased participation from private sector businesses and nonprofit organizations in the development of emergency planning by developing stronger partnerships with LEPCs and other public preparedness agencies.

Revenues and Expenditures

The Planning Committee does not receive either state General Funds or federal direct appropriations to complete its work. Members do not receive per diem or reimbursement for travel-related expenses for meetings, although members may be reimbursed for travel expenses for outreach visits and related conference expenses.

The Planning Committee receives funding from the Hazardous Materials Emergency Preparedness grant, which is utilized to fund related activities such as the trainings provided by the DFPC, the annual LEPC conference and Hazardous Materials Emergency Preparedness Chemical Safety Workshops. Expenditures for both the LEPC Conference and the DFPC Hazmat Training totaled \$253,997 in calendar year 2016, and \$323,730 in calendar year 2017.

³² Pub.L. 99-499

Meetings of the Planning Committee

The Planning Committee meets bimonthly during odd-numbered months, and all meetings are open to the public.³³

Table 3
Meetings of the Planning Committee
Calendar Years 2016 through 2017

Date	Members Attending
March 16, 2016	9
May 11, 2016	8
July 13, 2016	9
November 9, 2016	8
January 11, 2017	9
March 8, 2017	10
July 12, 2017	8
November 8, 2017	8

Table 3 specifies that the Planning Committee held a total of eight meetings with four meetings scheduled in both calendar years 2016 and 2017. The average number of members in attendance was nine members per meeting.

Proposals and Accomplishments

In calendar years 2016 and 2017, the Planning Committee provided support to LEPCs and emergency preparedness through outreach activities including:

- Technical support via onsite outreach visits. In calendar year 2016, three outreach visits were completed and in calendar year 2017, 20 outreach visits were completed.
- Division of Fire Prevention and Control's Hazmat Training and Hazardous Materials Emergency Preparedness Chemical Safety Workshops. In 2016, over 1,000 first responders received training in over 17 types of preparedness and response course offerings. In calendar year 2017, over 1,500 first responders received a training in 12 types of preparedness and response course offerings.
- The LEPC Annual Conference. The LEPC conference highlights a variety of critical issues regarding emergency preparedness. In calendar year 2016, 107 participants attended the conference and the calendar year 2017 conference yielded participation from 110 participants.

³³ Colorado Emergency Planning Committee. *Annual Report (2017)*, p.6.

-
- Legislative recommendations. House Bill 16-1046 was drafted and enacted based upon Planning Committee recommendations regarding hazardous materials cleanup and existing statute implementation.
 - Tier II reporting. “Tier II” is a reporting form which is utilized to gather mandatory reported information from facilities that are governed by EPCRA. Required information includes the facility name and address, quantities of chemicals used at the facility and the location of the chemicals. The Planning Committee continues its work with CDPHE to reduce costs and improve efficiencies of the Tier II reporting process for reporting facilities.
 - Tier II public web portal. The Planning Committee recommended the creation of the public web portal to relay Tier II information, which is a requirement of EPCRA. The public web portal is currently in development.

Reasons for Continuation

The Planning Committee is a federally mandated subcommittee within EPCRA. In addition, the Planning Committee provides technical assistance, training and support to LEPCs in order to increase statewide emergency preparedness, community planning and related educational outreach.

Analysis and Recommendation

The Planning Committee facilitates a forum for LEPCs, state government agencies, private sector and nonprofit organizations to more uniformly support emergency preparedness at a local level. The Planning Committee has completed several outreach activities in calendar years 2016 and 2017 that further the goals outlined in the Planning Committee’s federal mandate. Therefore, the General Assembly should continue the Planning Committee.

Public Safety Communications Subcommittee

Creation, Mission and Make-Up

The Public Safety Communications Subcommittee (Communications Subcommittee) is a permanent subcommittee under the Colorado Homeland Security and All-Hazards Senior Advisory Committee (HSAC) located within the Department of Public Safety's Division of Homeland Security and Emergency Management. Established in 2014 by Senate Bill 127, the Communications Subcommittee was tasked with providing an advisory role to the HSAC regarding legislation and other issues that involve public safety communication.

The Communications Subcommittee consists of 23 appointed members. The original members were all members of the Consolidated Communications System Authority, and are replaced by individuals that represent the same interests. Members serve the organization that they represent with no official terms.

The following Communications Subcommittee members must be selected to represent local government:³⁴

- Two representatives of public radio systems that are not a part of the statewide digital trunked radio system, nominated by each entity and appointed by the Executive Director of the Department of Public Safety;
- One representative of a licensed ambulance or emergency medical service and licensed hospital or trauma center, selected by the State Emergency Medical and Trauma Services Advisory Council;
- Two representatives of the nine all-hazard regions, nominated by each entity and appointed by the Executive Director of the Department of Public Safety;
- Two representatives of fire departments, one that represents a metropolitan fire department and the other that represents a rural fire department, selected by the Colorado State Fire Chiefs' Association;
- One representative of Colorado Professional Fire Fighters or another organization that represents fire fighters, appointed by the Colorado Professional Fire Fighters organization;
- One representative of a Colorado county appointed by Colorado Counties, Incorporated, or an organization that represents Colorado counties;
- Five representatives from the Consolidated Communications Network of Colorado, or a non-profit organization that consists of participating user agencies that utilize the Colorado digital trunked radio system, appointed by the Consolidated Communications Network of Colorado; and
- Two representatives from law enforcement agencies, one who is selected by the Colorado Association of Chiefs of Police and the other who is selected by the County Sheriffs of Colorado.

³⁴ § 24-33.5-1614(3.3)(e), C.R.S.

The following Communications Subcommittee members must be selected to represent state government:

- The Chief Information Officer of the Governor’s Office of Information Technology, or his/her designee;
- The Chief of the Colorado State Patrol, or his/her designee;
- The Executive Director of the Department of Corrections, or his/her designee;
- The Executive Director of the Department of Transportation, or his/her designee; and
- The Executive Director of the Department of Natural Resources, or his/her designee.

Additional members required in statute include two representatives of the two tribal nations in Colorado (Ute Mountain Ute Tribe and the Southern Ute Indian Tribe), appointed by the tribes, one from each tribe.

Responsibilities of the Communications Subcommittee

The purposes of the Communications Subcommittee are to:³⁵

- Promote interoperable communications throughout Colorado among public safety organizations;
- Represent HSAC regarding issues of public safety communications and interoperability of communication systems; and
- Keep HSAC informed regarding the development, maintenance, upgrade, and operation of the statewide digital trunked radio system.

The duties of the Communications Subcommittee are to:³⁶

- Provide an annual report to the Joint Budget Committee no later than December 31 each year which includes operational and capital infrastructure needs for system maintenance;
- Offer policy recommendations and promote efficient use of resources as they relate to communications interoperability;
- Promote cooperation among local, tribal, state and federal public safety agencies and other nongovernmental organizations that provide public safety through addressing statewide radio interoperability within the state;
- Provide assistance to public safety entities regarding the development of projects, plans, policies, standards, priorities, guidelines, and training for radio interoperability;
- Ensure a satisfactory wireless spectrum that accommodates all users through coordination with communication oversight groups;

³⁵ § 24-33.5-1614(3.3)(b), C.R.S.

³⁶ § 24-33.5-1614(3.3)(c), C.R.S.

-
- Research the best practices of other states, tribes, and municipalities relating to statewide interoperable communications;
 - Provide recommendations to HSAC regarding statewide interoperable radio communications utilized for public safety in the state, including the topics of governance, standard operating procedures, technology, training, and funding; and
 - Consider providing a report to the Executive Director of the Department of Public Safety before December 31, 2014, regarding:
 - Long-term sustainability, adaptability, and the evolution of related technology; and
 - Bandwidth required for current and future emergency communication needs.

Revenues and Expenditures

The Communications Subcommittee does not receive any revenue for its operations, and does not have any expenditures. Members of the Communications Subcommittee provide their services on a volunteer basis.

Meetings of the Communications Subcommittee

The Communications Subcommittee generally met on a monthly basis in fiscal years 16-17 and 17-18, and the average attendance was 15 members per meeting.

Proposals and Their Status

In fiscal years 16-17 and 17-18, the Communications Subcommittee promoted public safety interoperable communications through its work and made recommendations including:

- Requested that the legislature provide funding for related system maintenance, sustainability and improvements through the reallocation of existing taxes;
- Requested that the legislature strengthen the public safety communications infrastructure, including repositioning the Communications Subcommittee directly under the Colorado Department of Public Safety from its current position as a subcommittee under HSAC;
- Recommended that the Public Safety Trust Fund should be increased in order to be inclusive of all radio stations in Colorado;
- Testified before legislative committees and provided analysis regarding 2018 legislation, including Senate Bill 18-158, School Access to Interoperable Communication Technology, which was signed by the Governor;
- Hosted a conference referred to as the Radio Summit for the past five years, which provides a variety of presentations, classes and workshops related to radio system interoperability;

-
- Requested funding from the legislature for a comprehensive business plan and needs assessment regarding all public safety radio communication systems within the state, to expand beyond the 2015 Digital Trunked Radio System Assessment; and
 - Promoted changes, that were implemented, to House Bill 16-1040, Auxiliary Emergency Communications, which was signed by the Governor in June 2016, and House Bill 18-1061, No Encryption of Radio Dispatch Communications, which was postponed indefinitely.

To date, no additional legislative action has been taken and no additional funding streams have been authorized regarding the requests or recommendations of the Communications Subcommittee.

Reasons for Continuation

The Communications Subcommittee has worked closely with stakeholders in the public safety communications network and other public safety organizations, and has provided recommendations and feedback to both the General Assembly and the Governor regarding potential improvements to the current infrastructure. Further, the Communications Subcommittee has provided educational outreach through its Radio Summit conference and continues to accept feedback in order to strengthen public safety communication in Colorado.

Analysis and Recommendation

The Communications Subcommittee continues to offer a forum for discussion and input to participant groups and other stakeholders, and regularly provides insight to HSAC and the legislature to create policy recommendations to strengthen the critical public safety communications system in Colorado. For these reasons, the General Assembly should continue the Communications Subcommittee.

Colorado Human Trafficking Council

Creation, Mission and Make-Up

Human trafficking is a prevalent issue across the state of Colorado. In 2016, 120 tips of human trafficking in Colorado were reported to the National Human Trafficking Hotline, which paralleled an increase in tips reported nationally in the same year.³⁷ Additionally, between 2014 and 2016, 97 cases were filed in Colorado that involved human trafficking statutes, with 24 cases resulting in convictions.³⁸

The Colorado Revised Statutes (C.R.S.), contain three sets of statutes in Title 18 that relate specifically to human trafficking, and provide a definition of the act of human trafficking in its various forms.

Section 18-3-503(1), C.R.S., provides that an individual is guilty of human trafficking for involuntary servitude if he or she,

knowingly sells, recruits, harbors, transports, transfers, isolates, entices, provides, receives, or obtains by any means another person for the purpose of coercing the other person to perform labor or services...

Section 18-3-504(1)(a), C.R.S., provides that an individual is guilty of human trafficking for sexual servitude if he or she,

knowingly sells, recruits, harbors, transports, transfers, isolates, entices, provides, receives, or obtains by any means another person for the purpose of coercing the person to engage in commercial sexual activity...

Further, section 18-3-504(2), C.R.S., provides that an individual is guilty of human trafficking of a minor for sexual servitude if he or she,

knowingly sells, recruits, harbors, transports, transfers, isolates, entices, provides, receives, obtains by any means, maintains or makes available a minor for the purpose of commercial sexual activity...

The Colorado Human Trafficking Council (Human Trafficking Council) was established in fiscal year 14-15 by House Bill 14-1273 as an outcome of recommendations listed in the

³⁷ Jesse Paul, "2016 saw bump in Colorado human trafficking cases reported to national hotline," *The Denver Post*, January 31, 2017. Retrieved September 5, 2018, from: <https://www.denverpost.com/2017/01/31/colorado-human-trafficking-cases-2016/>

³⁸ Colorado Human Trafficking Council. *Annual Report* (2017), p. 14.

Uniform Act on Prevention of and Remedies for Human Trafficking (Act).³⁹ The Act recommended increased coordination within each state through the creation of state human trafficking councils to develop plans, collect and review related data, promote public awareness, and conduct training and related activities regarding human trafficking on the state level.

Section 18-3-505(1)(a), C.R.S., defines the purpose of the Human Trafficking Council as,

...bring[ing] together leadership from community-based and system-based anti-trafficking efforts from across the state, to build and enhance collaboration among communities, counties and sectors within the state, to establish and improve comprehensive services for victims of human trafficking, to assist in the successful prosecution of human traffickers, and to help prevent human trafficking in Colorado.

The Human Trafficking Council presently consists of 31 members serving four-year terms who are appointed in the following manner:⁴⁰

- Two representatives appointed by the Executive Director of the Department of Human Services that work within that department;
- One representative of the Department of Law, appointed by the Attorney General;
- One representative appointed by the Executive Director of the Department of Labor and Employment; and
- One representative appointed by the Executive Director of the Department of Public Safety from the Colorado State Patrol that can address the issues of human smuggling and human trafficking.

The Governor or his/her designee appoints the following Human Trafficking Council members:⁴¹

- One representative from a statewide association of police chiefs;
- One representative from a statewide association of county sheriffs;
- One representative from a statewide coalition for victims of sexual assault;
- One representative from a statewide organization that offers services to crime victims;
- One representative from a statewide immigrant rights organization;
- One representative from a statewide organization of district attorneys;
- One representative from a statewide organization of criminal defense attorneys;

³⁹ National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws. *Uniform Act on Prevention of and Remedies for Human Trafficking* (2013), pg. 12-13.

⁴⁰ §§ 18-3-505(1)(b)(I) through (IV), C.R.S.

⁴¹ §§ 18-3-505(1)(b)(V) through (XX), C.R.S.

-
- Three to five representatives from a regional or city-wide human trafficking task force or coalition;
 - One representative from a nonprofit organization that provides treatment or housing for human trafficking victims;
 - One representative from a college or university department that conducts research related to human trafficking;
 - One representative from a statewide organization that works as a legal advocate for at-risk, neglected, and abused children;
 - Two representatives who offer direct services to victims of human trafficking;
 - One representative from a faith-based organization that offers assistance to victims of human trafficking;
 - Two representatives who are each a director of a county department of social services, one from an urban county and the other from a rural county;
 - One representative who provides child welfare services working for a county department of social services; and
 - Two representatives who are former victims of human trafficking, one of whom is a former victim of involuntary servitude, and the other who is a former victim of sexual servitude.

Additional members include:⁴²

- One representative from a child advocacy center,
- One representative appointed by the Commissioner of Agriculture, and
- One representative appointed by the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court who represents the Judicial Branch.

The Human Trafficking Council also designates objectives to a variety of task forces and working groups in order to focus on specific aspects of the Human Trafficking Council's legislative mandates. These include:⁴³

- Data and Research Task Force
- Standards and Certification Task Force
- Training Standards and Curricula Task Force
- Grants Funding Working Group
- Public Awareness Working Group
- Labor and Trafficking Task Force
- Training Work Group
- Legislative Task Force
- Prevention Task Force

⁴² §§ 18-3-505(XXI) through (XXIII), C.R.S.

⁴³ Colorado Human Trafficking Council. *Annual Report (2017)*, pp. vii-viii; *Annual Report (2015)*, pp. vii-viii; x.

Responsibilities of the Human Trafficking Council

The Colorado General Assembly specified that the Human Trafficking Council should meet a minimum of four times per year and complete the following legislatively mandated tasks:⁴⁴

- Make recommendations to the judiciary committees of the Colorado House of Representatives and Senate prior to January 1, 2016, regarding:
 - The potential establishment of standards and a process for the certification of organizations that provide services to human trafficking victims;
 - The potential establishment of a grant program for organizations that provide services to human trafficking victims, including consideration regarding how such a grant program should be funded;
 - Providing legislative recommendations concerning:
 - The prosecution of or granting of immunity to a child victim of commercial sexual exploitation for offenses related to that exploitation;⁴⁵
 - The creation of other legal protections, including statutory defenses for child victims of commercial sexual exploitation for offenses related to that exploitation, and the creation of changes to Title 19, C.R.S., to implement those legal protections or defenses;⁴⁶ and
 - Standards, guidelines, or mandates regarding the assessment, placement and treatment of child victims of commercial sexual exploitation through Title 19, C.R.S.;⁴⁷
- Provide reports to the judiciary committees by January 1, 2017, and each year thereafter regarding the work of the Human Trafficking Council in the previous year;
- Make recommendations as are deemed necessary regarding statutory changes that would facilitate the prosecution and punishment of individuals engaged in human trafficking and to protect victims of human trafficking;
- Develop an implementation plan for a public awareness campaign to educate the public about human trafficking that includes easily accessible and readily available victims services contact information;
- Develop training standards and curricula for organizations that provide assistance to victims of human trafficking and law enforcement agencies;
- Identify best practices for the prevention of human trafficking, particularly for the prevention of child sex trafficking;
- Report to the judiciary committees annually regarding data collection relating to the prevalence of human trafficking, and the efforts of law enforcement to combat human trafficking in Colorado; and
- Research and pursue funding opportunities for the Human Trafficking Council.

⁴⁴ § 18-3-505(4), C.R.S.

⁴⁵ § 18-3-505(4)(a)(III)(A), C.R.S.

⁴⁶ § 18-3-505(4)(a)(III)(B), C.R.S.

⁴⁷ § 18-3-505(4)(a)(III)(C), C.R.S.

Revenues and Expenditures

The Human Trafficking Council received \$270,770 per fiscal year in state General Funds for fiscal years 16-17 and 17-18. In Table 4, below, Human Trafficking Council expenditures are divided into two separate categories for reporting purposes: staff expenditures (2.3 total full-time equivalent employees) and direct Human Trafficking Council expenditures.

Table 4
Human Trafficking Council Expenditures
Fiscal Years 16-17 and 17-18

Fiscal Year	Staff Expenditures	Direct Expenditures	Total
16-17	\$201,219	\$11,154	\$212,373
17-18	\$242,739	\$18,063	\$260,802

Although the Human Trafficking Council was legislatively mandated to develop training curricula, no funding was included in House Bill 14-1273 to deliver the training(s) once created. In order to ensure that trainings would be available, the Department of Public Safety's Division of Criminal Justice applied for and was awarded the Victims of Crimes Act (VOCA) Training Grant as a one-time funding source. The revenue received by the Division of Criminal Justice for the VOCA Training Grant was \$51,362 and the total training grant has been expended. Table 5 demonstrates the types of expenditures for fiscal years 16-17 and 17-18 for the VOCA Training Grant.

Table 5
VOCA Training Grant Expenditures
Fiscal Years 16-17 and 17-18

Fiscal Year	Personnel	Operating Costs	Travel	Total
16-17	\$17,427	\$1,413	\$288	\$19,128
17-18	\$30,263	\$482	\$1,489	\$32,234

Meetings of the Human Trafficking Council

Table 6, below, reflects that Human Trafficking Council meetings are generally held on a monthly basis, on the fourth Friday of each month.

Table 6
Human Trafficking Council Meetings
2017 and 2018

Meeting Date	Number of Council Members in Attendance (includes remote attendance)	Members of the Public Present
January 6, 2017	28	2
February 24, 2017	22	20
March 24, 2017	17	15
April 28, 2017	22	11
May 26, 2017	21	14
June 23, 2017	21	12
July 28, 2017	24	1
August 9, 2017	26	12
September 22, 2017	23	16
October 27, 2017	25	14
November 17, 2017	21	6
January 26, 2018	23	4
February 23, 2018	24	10
March 23, 2018	20	3
April 27, 2018	16	10
May 25, 2018	23	4
June 22, 2018	25	9

The average attendance of council members was approximately 22 members per meeting.

Proposals and Their Status

The General Assembly tasked the Human Trafficking Council upon its inception with a series of mandates to guide its work. The Human Trafficking Council has produced outcomes in several of the areas originally mandated, including:

Section 18-3-505(4)(a)(I), C.R.S., requires that the Human Trafficking Council make recommendations to the judiciary committees prior to January 1, 2016, regarding the

potential establishment of standards and a process for the certification of organizations that provide services to human trafficking victims:

- This mandate was assigned for review to the Standards and Certification Task Force from calendar years 2015 through 2017;
- The Human Trafficking Council developed specific standards for community-based victim advocates and mental/behavioral health providers who specialize in assisting victims of human trafficking (2016);
- The Human Trafficking Council developed additional comprehensive standards for adult housing providers, licensed 24-hour child care facilities, and state-operated Division of Youth Services facilities in order to provide guidance to housing providers who provide housing to survivors of human trafficking (2017); and
- The Colorado Department of Human Services incorporated many of the proposed standards of the Human Trafficking Council relating to licensed 24-hour childcare facilities as a part of proposed Volume 7 rule changes (2018).⁴⁸ A final version of the rule changes are still pending.

Section 18-3-505(4)(a)(II), C.R.S., requires that the Human Trafficking Council make recommendations to the judiciary committees to develop a grant program for organizations that provide services to human trafficking victims:

- The Grants Working Group was established by the Human Trafficking Council, and completed a review of the accessibility/types of grant funding sources available for those organizations that provide services to victims of human trafficking (2017).

Section 18-3-505(4)(a)(III), C.R.S., requires that the Human Trafficking Council provide further legislative recommendations to the judiciary committees regarding the “prosecution of or granting of immunity to a child victim of commercial sexual exploitation for offenses related to that exploitation,” the creation of legal protections for child victims of commercial sexual exploitation, and the creation of standards, guidelines, or mandates regarding the assessment, placement, and treatment for child victims of commercial sexual exploitation:

- The Human Trafficking Council provided three legislative recommendations regarding child victims of commercial sexual exploitation (2015),
 - The Human Trafficking Council recommended that the General Assembly enact Safe Harbor legislation for child victims of commercial sexual exploitation by including an immunity provision for the charge of prostitution. Legislation was recommended to include a 24-month implementation plan and a sunset and post-enactment review.
 - The Human Trafficking Council recommended “no further action at this time” regarding other types of legal protections for child victims of commercial sexual exploitation.

⁴⁸ 12 CCR § 2509-4, Social Services Rules, Rule Manual Volume 7, Child Welfare Services.

-
- The Human Trafficking Council recommended that Title 19, C.R.S., provisions regarding existing temporary custody should be utilized with the Safe Harbor Law for the assessment, placement and treatment of identified/suspected child victims.
 - As a result of the Human Trafficking Council’s recommendations, the General assembly added human trafficking for sexual servitude of minors to the definition of child abuse and neglect (section 19-1-103(1)(a)(VIII), C.R.S.), required a child welfare response (section 19-3-308(4)(c), C.R.S.), and mandated the use of a screening tool to identify minor victims of human trafficking for the sexual servitude of minors in section 19-3-317, C.R.S.

Section 18-3-505(4)(b), C.R.S., requires that the Human Trafficking Council provide reports to the judiciary committees by January 1, 2017, and each year after regarding the work of the Human Trafficking Council in the previous year:

- The Human Trafficking Council has published annual reports every January since calendar year 2016 for a total of three annual reports. Each report is publicly available on the Human Trafficking Council’s website.

Section 18-3-505(4)(c), C.R.S., requires that the Human Trafficking Council make recommendations regarding statutory changes that would assist in the prosecution of individuals engaged in human trafficking and further support victims:

- The Labor Trafficking Task Force was established by the Human Trafficking Council to provide additional research and recommendations for statutory reform (2018); and
- The task force will publish its recommendations as a part of the 2018 Annual Report.

Section 18-3-505(4)(d), C.R.S., requires that the Human Trafficking Council create an implementation plan for a public awareness campaign to inform the public regarding human trafficking and place victims’ services contact information in places where victims of human trafficking are likely to see it:

- The Human Trafficking Council contracted with a communications and marketing firm to begin research and to develop a plan for a comprehensive public awareness outreach campaign, which was approved by the Human Trafficking Council (2018);
- The Human Trafficking Council will begin implementing the initial phase of the public awareness campaign once funding is secured;
- The public awareness campaign is slated for completion within approximately five years, and will utilize television, radio, social media, and other paid media sources, such as billboards and printed advertisements. The Human Trafficking Council will also engage additional agencies and organizations in order to assist with the dissemination of the public awareness campaign message; and

-
- Throughout the campaign, public perceptions of the campaign will be evaluated and changes in community awareness levels related to the issue of human trafficking will be assessed.

Section 18-3-505(4)(e), C.R.S., requires that the Human Trafficking Council develop training standards and curricula for organizations and law enforcement agencies that provide assistance to victims of human trafficking:

- This mandate was assigned to the Training Task Force in 2016 and the Training Working Group in 2017;
- The Human Trafficking Council completed the development of several introductory human trafficking training programs, designed for a wide variety of professionals in order to establish a common language and to provide contextual information regarding human trafficking in Colorado. These programs are being disseminated to appropriate audiences around the state by the Division of Criminal Justice staff and community facilitators who completed the Human Trafficking Council's Train-the-Trainer workshops (2016, 2017 and 2018). In 2017, 1,906 individuals were trained; and
- The Human Trafficking Council began to offer the Train-the-Trainer curriculum to various agencies, organizations and community groups, including law enforcement (2017 and 2018).

Section 18-3-505(4)(f), C.R.S., requires the Human Trafficking Council to identify best practices for human trafficking prevention, particularly for the prevention of child sex trafficking:

- The Human Trafficking Council established the Prevention Task Force in order to identify preventative efforts to stop human trafficking victimization (2018); and
- The Human Trafficking Council will provide its recommendations for best practices for the prevention of human trafficking in its 2018 report.

Section 18-3-505(4)(g), C.R.S., requires that the Human Trafficking Council collect data regarding the prevalence of human trafficking in Colorado, and the efforts of law enforcement to combat human trafficking in Colorado, to be provided to the judiciary committees through annual reporting:

- This mandate was assigned to the Data and Research Task Force from 2015 to present, which includes,
 - Incidence data from multiple sources including federal agencies, local law enforcement task forces, state judicial filings, service providers, and both state and national human trafficking hotlines, which have been provided in each of the prior three years' Human Trafficking Council annual reports;
 - A survey of law enforcement was conducted to gather further information regarding human trafficking investigative efforts in Colorado including challenges, successes, and lessons learned (2015);
 - Prosecution study conducted in order to gain further insight regarding human trafficking prosecution activities (2017); and

-
- Two informational sessions held with law enforcement to gather additional details regarding reporting practices to improve the process of data collection (2017).

Additional ongoing work of the Human Trafficking Council includes:

- Translation of human trafficking training programs to an online format utilizing the Department of Public Safety's Distance Learning Management System. As of this writing, the online program is in beta testing, with plans to begin delivering curriculum in the fall of 2018;
- Additional advanced training is under development for victim advocates, case managers, and mental health professionals who provide services to victims of human trafficking. Additional trainings may be developed for educators, first responders, and other health care providers;
- Seventy facilitators are currently trained to deliver two introductory level human trafficking courses, with an additional 15 planned to be trained by the end of 2018.
- Law enforcement data collection is ongoing regarding human trafficking related arrests, open cases, and victim recoveries;
- National and state hotline data collection will be utilized to monitor the effects of the human trafficking public awareness campaign;
- Continuance of data collection from federally funded service providers regarding the number of victims they serve;
- Data collection and tracking of criminal cases filed within the Colorado state court system related to charges of human trafficking;
- Outreach and research regarding the accessibility of victims' services and survivor experiences in the criminal justice system;
- Consideration of additional recommendations regarding labor trafficking prevention and intervention by the Labor Trafficking Task Force within the Human Trafficking Council. Recommendations may also include a revision of the wage theft law and additional requirements for Colorado's foreign labor recruiters;
- Obtained additional grant funding (Colorado Department of Human Services/Colorado Department of Public Safety joint funding) to work with Colorado Department of Human Services in the development of additional training and data collection regarding human trafficking of children;
- Development and publication of a four-step process for identifying additional human trafficking prevention strategies;
- Collaboration with regional human trafficking groups;
- Continuing to develop and include additional resources on the Human Trafficking Council's website, including the council's monthly newsletter, calendar, and other resource links; and
- Continued participation in the National Compendium of State-Run Anti-Trafficking Initiatives, which currently includes 26 states and provides a forum for discussion regarding anti-trafficking efforts across the country in order to share strategies regarding policy initiatives.

Reasons for Continuation

Human trafficking continues to pose unique challenges in Colorado, and the Human Trafficking Council has addressed many complex issues through its work and recommendations. The Human Trafficking Council has the unique opportunity to provide a forum for coordination between state agencies, statewide service organizations, and regional task forces. The Human Trafficking Council strives to increase the accessibility of data and resources to make access to services for victims of human trafficking more available and to offer more efficient tools for the prosecution of those who engage in human trafficking within the state.

Analysis and Recommendation

There are various perspectives regarding the work of the Human Trafficking Council, but the majority of stakeholders who provided feedback throughout the course of this review supported its continuance.

Some of the feedback provided suggested that several of the Human Trafficking Council's internal processes and appointment types may warrant further examination. For example, some feedback received contained common themes regarding issues related to communication, transparency, clarity regarding the goals of the Human Trafficking Council, and stakeholder participation. Additionally, some feedback offered suggestions for improvements to the effectiveness of the Human Trafficking Council by revising the appointed seat types mandated in statute to include more victims, victim advocates, and labor trafficking specialists in order to bring a balance to the perspective and goals of the Human Trafficking Council in what is currently perceived by some to hold a heavy government agency/law enforcement presence.

Overall, stakeholder feedback supported the notion that the collaborative work of the Human Trafficking Council has provided a valuable tool by engaging in related research, trainings, victims' access to services, and campaigns to increase public awareness in order to expand the effectiveness of human trafficking reduction efforts in Colorado. For these reasons, the General Assembly should continue the Human Trafficking Council.

Standing Efficiency and Accountability Committee

Creation, Mission and Make-Up

The Standing Efficiency and Accountability Committee (Accountability Committee) was initially established in 2009, disbanded in 2013, and reestablished in 2016 as a result of recommendations provided in the 2015 performance audit completed by the Office of the State Auditor regarding the implementation of the Funding Advancements for Surface Transportation and Economic Recovery (FASTER) Act.⁴⁹ The Accountability Committee is a subordinate entity to the Transportation Commission (Commission) within the Colorado Department of Transportation (CDOT). The purpose of the Accountability Committee is to ensure efficiency and compliance with state and federal laws within CDOT operations and report actions taken by CDOT related to the FASTER audit.⁵⁰ The Accountability Committee is comprised of members from the executive and legislative branches, and additional members from outside of state government:⁵¹

From the executive branch:

- One representative from the Commission, designated by the Commission;
- One representative from CDOT's Office of the Executive Director, designated by the Executive Director of CDOT;
- One representative from each division of CDOT, designated by the Executive Director of CDOT; and
- Any additional CDOT employees that the Executive Director of CDOT designates.

From the legislative branch:

- Two representatives from the House of Representatives (House), one appointed from the majority party by the Speaker of the House, and one appointed from the minority party by the Minority Leader of the House; and
- Two representatives from the Senate, one representative appointed from the majority party by the President of the Senate and one representative appointed from the minority party by the Senate Minority Leader.

⁴⁹ The term FASTER refers to Senate Bill 09-108 titled, *Funding Advancements for Surface Transportation and Economic Recovery (FASTER)*, also referred to as the Faster Act of 2009. The act provided six additional motor vehicle fees allocated to CDOT and local governments for the purpose of bridge, road safety, and public transit development.

⁵⁰ § 43-1-106(17)(b), C.R.S.

⁵¹ § 43-1-106(17)(a), C.R.S.

From outside of state government, representatives from:

- The construction industry,
- The engineering industry,
- The environmental community,
- Organizations that involve transportation planning,
- Public transportation providers,
- Counties,
- Municipalities,
- Nonpartisan organizations of good governance, and
- Members of other groups or industries that the Commission deems should be represented on the Accountability Committee.

Members outside of state government are selected directly by CDOT. Inquiry letters were sent to stakeholder groups to determine the level of interest in participation in the work of the Accountability Committee. These members were then selected from interested parties.

Responsibilities of the Accountability Committee

According to section 43-1-106(17)(b), Colorado Revised Statutes (C.R.S.), the Accountability Committee is mandated to report periodically to the Commission and the Executive Director of CDOT to make recommendations that increase efficiency in the department's processes and address any state or federal compliance issues. Additionally, the Accountability Committee is required to review the 2015 performance audit⁵² and report on the "appropriateness, effectiveness and efficiency" related to the FASTER motor vehicle fee revenue. The Executive Director of CDOT or his/her designee is further required to report at least once per year regarding the work and recommendations of the Accountability Committee to the House and Senate committees that have jurisdiction over CDOT's activities.

Revenues and Expenditures

The Accountability Committee does not receive any revenue and has no expenditures. The members of the Accountability Committee meet on a volunteer basis.

⁵² Colorado State Auditor. *Collection and Usage of the FASTER Motor Vehicle Fees; (2015)*. Retrieved September 17, 2018, from www.leg.colorado.gov/audits/collection-and-usage-faster-motor-vehicle-fees

Meetings of the Accountability Committee

Table 7, below, provides information regarding the meetings of the Accountability Committee. The table lists the meeting dates and the number of members present for each meeting.

Table 7
Accountability Committee Meetings
Fiscal Years 16-17 and 17-18

Meeting Date	Number of Committee Members in Attendance
September 15, 2016	22
December 15, 2016	Unknown
March 10, 2017	17
June 15, 2017	17
July 20, 2017	18
September 21, 2017	15

The Accountability Committee generally meets on a quarterly basis and the average attendance by members was 18 per meeting.

Proposals and Their Status

The following recommendations and related tasks have been completed by the Accountability Committee:

- According to staff, in August 2018, the Accountability Committee presented recommendations to the Transportation Legislative Review Committee to request draft legislation that provides additional efficiencies for the Chief Engineer of CDOT and the Transportation Commission to quickly approve right of way acquisitions.
- In 2018, CDOT provided a presentation regarding the discussions within the Accountability Committee at the annual SMART Act hearing.
- The Accountability Committee reviewed the FASTER audit, as was statutorily mandated, over the course of multiple meetings. The Accountability Committee determined that no further recommendations needed to be made, as it was determined that CDOT is sufficiently addressing matters that were highlighted in the audit.

Reasons for Sunset

The members of the Accountability Committee participated in discussions regarding ways to potentially increase efficiency and compliance within CDOT. Further, the Accountability Committee reviewed the findings of the FASTER audit as was mandated in statute.

Analysis and Recommendation

The Accountability Committee has reviewed the findings of the FASTER audit, and has discussed several issues related to the efficiency and processes of CDOT operations. To date, no additional work recommendations have been established by the Accountability Committee, and the tasks mandated in statute have been completed. If CDOT requires additional assistance in the future, an *ad hoc* committee could be established in order to perform specifically identified tasks. Therefore, the General Assembly should sunset the Accountability Committee.